

Right to Education

Scope and Implementation



General Comment 13 on the right to education
(Art. 13 of the International Covenant on
Economic, Social and Cultural Rights)



United Nations
Educational, Scientific and
Cultural Organization



Economic and Social
Council

(ED-2003/WS/73)

FOREWORD

Achieving the right to education for all is one of the biggest challenges of our times. The second International Development Goal addresses this challenge: universalizing primary education in all countries by 2015. This is also one of the main objectives set at the World Education Forum (April 2000), where the right to basic education for all was reaffirmed as a fundamental human right.

Article 13 of the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights covers this right most comprehensively. The provisions it contains were drafted at the suggestion of UNESCO's Director-General. The right to education is also recognized in other international and regional instruments. A number of instruments elaborated by UNESCO relating to the right to education give expression to this right in its different aspects.

The fundamental question is how the obligations relating to the right to education undertaken by Member States under international and regional instruments are incorporated into national legal systems? This is all the more important for achieving the Dakar goals, in keeping with the commitments made by Governments for providing education for all, especially free and compulsory quality basic education. But in spite of such legal obligations and political commitments, millions of children still remain deprived of educational opportunities, many of them on account of poverty. They must have access to basic education as of right, in particular to primary education which must be free. Poverty must not be a hindrance and the claim by the poor to such education must be recognized and reinforced.

The responsibility devolves upon Governments to ensure that political commitments undertaken at the World Education Forum are translated into national laws and policies. As a result, the constitutional and legislative foundation of the right to education assume added significance, taking fully into account the legal implications of the Dakar Framework for Action. The Discussion on the Right to Education and Follow-up to the World Education Forum (Dakar, April 2000) organized by the United Nations Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (UNCESCR), in co-operation with UNESCO on 14 May 2002, clearly showed how crucial it was to introduce constitutional provisions on the right to education as well as appropriate enabling legislation so that the State obligations under the relevant international conventions are incorporated into the domestic legal order.

In that spirit, it is crucial to give impetus to normative action so as to ensure more effective implementation of instruments relating to the right to education, especially those of UNESCO, on the one hand; and to accord due place to the right to basic education for all in national legal system, on the other. For this purpose, the obligations undertaken by States and their implications for the Government action at national level must be fully recognized and appreciated. Moreover, Member States must be guided in this action for reporting to the monitoring bodies.

The General Comment n° 13 on Article 13 of the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights serves such a purpose¹. It was elaborated by the United Nations Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (UNCESCR), in collaboration with UNESCO. This General Comment elucidates the import of the right to education for reporting on its implementation and the effect given to the State obligations by the Governments. It refers to several UNESCO's standard-setting instruments, notably the Convention against Discrimination in Education (1960) and the World Declaration on Education for All (1990). It elucidates the obligations of the State – the obligation to respect, protect and fulfill². Just as the Dakar Framework for Action, this General Comment provides for the right to receive free and compulsory primary education, which should be made available to every one, and enjoins upon the State Parties to the Covenant obligation for its progressive realization. This obligation has been interpreted to be of continuing nature for moving as expeditiously and effectively as possible towards the realization of this right and is of immediate effect³.

In the context of the Millennium Development goals, the General Comment n° 13 on the right to education should be interpreted broadly. As the Informal Expert Consultation on Monitoring the Right to Education organized by UNESCO in March 2001 suggested, the follow-up to the World Education Forum should be linked to the implementation of international and regional instruments. The experts underlined the need for (i) examining the bases of the Dakar Framework for Action in both modern comparative constitutional law and conventional international law, and (ii) establishing the relationship between the Dakar Framework for Action and existing normative instruments as a continuity of existing law. Moreover, it is expected that as a follow-up to the World Education Forum, the countries should modernize their legislation.

1. For a commentary on and an analysis of the applications of this article, see Implementation of the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, General Comment n° 13 (twenty-first session of the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, 1999), The right to education (Art. 13 of the Covenant), Document E/C.12/1999/10, 8 December 1999.

2. Ibid. (para. 50).

3. Ibid. (paras 43-44).

4. EFA Global Monitoring Report 2002, *Education for All: is the World on Track?*, UNESCO Publishing, 2002 (p. 14).

The General Comment would be useful in that respect as well and especially for the more effective implementation of national legislation.

Elaborated just on the eve of the World Education Forum (April 2000), this General Comment has enhanced validity in today's context when more and more emphasis is being placed on the rights-based approach. The EFA Global Monitoring Report 2002 entitled "Education for All: Is the World on Track?" which underlines the importance of such an approach, states that "Where the right to education is guaranteed, people's access to and enjoyment of other rights is enhanced"⁴. This is also the central idea underlying the General Comment n° 13, which states at the outset that education not only as a right in itself but also "indispensable for the exercise of other human rights". In incorporating rights-based approach in future annual monitoring reports on Education for All (EFA), the General Comment n° 13 can be very useful.

The General Comment is also significant for ensuring the complementarity with the United Nations and the work of treaty monitoring bodies, especially UNESCO's collaboration with the United Nations Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (UNCESCR) in monitoring the implementation of UNESCO's instruments in the field of education. It would be helpful for encouraging Member States to respect their obligations under international conventions and treaties.

It is with great pleasure that we commend this General Comment to Member States, bearing in mind its importance for decision makers and Governments bodies having the responsibility in preparing national educational policies as well as legislation. We hold high expectation from Governments aimed at transforming the right to basic education for all from an ideal to a living reality.



John Daniel

Assistant Director-General for Education,
UNESCO



Virginia B. Dandan

Chairperson
United Nations Committee on Economic,
Social and Cultural Rights

**Implementation of the international covenant on
economic, social and cultural rights:
Article 13, right to education**

General Comment n° 13

IMPLEMENTATION OF THE INTERNATIONAL COVENANT ON ECONOMIC, SOCIAL AND CULTURAL RIGHTS

(General comment n° 13)

The right to education *(Article 13 of the Covenant) 1/*

1. Education is both a human right in itself and an indispensable means of realizing other human rights. As an empowerment right, education is the primary vehicle by which economically and socially marginalized adults and children can lift themselves out of poverty and obtain the means to participate fully in their communities. Education has a vital role in empowering women, safeguarding children from exploitative and hazardous labour and sexual exploitation, promoting human rights and democracy, protecting the environment, and controlling population growth.

Increasingly, education is recognized as one of the best financial investments States can make. But the importance of education is not just practical: a well-educated, enlightened and active mind, able to wander freely and widely, is one of the joys and rewards of human existence.

2. The International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (ICESCR) devotes two articles to the right to education, articles 13 and 14. Article 13, the longest provision in the Covenant, is the most wide-ranging and comprehensive article on the right to education in international human rights law. The Committee has already adopted General Comment 11 on article 14 (plans of action for primary education); General Comment 11 and the present general comment are complementary and should be considered together. The Committee is aware that for millions of people throughout the world, the enjoyment of the right to education remains a distant goal. Moreover, in many cases, this goal is becoming increasingly remote. The Committee is also conscious of the formidable structural and other obstacles impeding the full implementation of article 13 in many States parties.

3. With a view to assisting States parties' implementation of the Covenant and the fulfilment of their reporting obligations, this general comment focuses on the normative content of article 13 (Part I, paras. 4-42), some of the obligations arising from it (Part II, paras. 43-57), and some illustrative violations (Part II, paras. 58-59). Part III briefly remarks upon the obligations of actors other than States parties. The general comment is based upon the Committee's experience in examining States parties, reports over many years.

I. NORMATIVE CONTENT OF ARTICLE 13

Article 13 (1): Aims and objectives of education

4. States parties agree that all education, whether public or private, formal or non-formal, shall be directed towards the aims and objectives identified in article 13 (1). The Committee notes that these educational objectives reflect the fundamental purposes and principles of the United Nations as enshrined in Articles 1 and 2 of the Charter. For the most part, they are also found in article 26 (2) of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights, although article 13 (1) adds to the Declaration in three respects: education shall be directed to the human personality's "sense of dignity", it shall "enable all persons to participate effectively in a free society", and it shall promote understanding among all "ethnic" groups, as well as nations and racial and religious groups. Of those educational objectives which are common to article 26 (2) of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights and article 13 (1) of the Covenant, perhaps the most fundamental is that "education shall be directed to the full development of the human personality".
5. The Committee notes that since the General Assembly adopted the Covenant in 1966, other international instruments have further elaborated the objectives to which education should be directed. Accordingly, the Committee takes the view that States parties are required to ensure that education conforms to the aims and objectives identified in article 13 (1), as interpreted in the light of the World Declaration on Education for All (Jomtien, Thailand, 1990) (art. 1), the Convention on the Rights of the Child (art. 29 (1)), the Vienna Declaration and Programme of Action (Part I, para. 33 and Part II, para. 80), and the Plan of Action for the United Nations Decade for Human Rights Education (para. 2). While all these texts closely correspond to article 13 (1) of the Covenant, they also include elements which are not expressly provided for in article 13 (1), such as specific references to gender equality and respect for the environment.

These new elements are implicit in, and reflect a contemporary interpretation of article 13 (1). The Committee obtains support for this point of view from the widespread endorsement that the previously mentioned texts have received from all regions of the world (1).

Article 13 (2): The right to receive an education - some general remarks

6. While the precise and appropriate application of the terms will depend upon the conditions prevailing in a particular State party, education in all its forms and at all levels shall exhibit the following interrelated and essential features: (2).
 - a) **Availability** – functioning educational institutions and programmes have to be available in sufficient quantity within the jurisdiction of the State party. What they require to function depends upon numerous factors, including the developmental context within which they operate; for example, all institutions and programmes are likely to require buildings or other protection from the elements, sanitation facilities for both sexes, safe drinking water, trained teachers receiving domestically competitive salaries, teaching materials, and so on; while some will also require facilities such as a library, computer facilities and information technology;
 - b) **Accessibility** – educational institutions and programmes have to be accessible to everyone, without discrimination, within the jurisdiction of the State party. Accessibility has three overlapping dimensions:
 - i) **Non-discrimination** – education must be accessible to all, especially the most vulnerable groups, in law and fact, without discrimination on any of the prohibited grounds (see paras. 31-37 on non-discrimination);
 - ii) **Physical accessibility** – education has to be within safe physical reach, either by attendance at some reasonably convenient geographic location (e.g. a neighbourhood school) or via modern technology (e.g. access to a “distance learning” programme);
 - iii) **Economic accessibility** – education has to be affordable to all. This dimension of accessibility is subject to the differential wording of article 13 (2) in relation to primary, secondary and higher education: whereas primary education shall be available “free to all”, States parties are required to progressively introduce free secondary and higher education;
 - c) **Acceptability** – the form and substance of education, including curricula and

teaching methods, have to be acceptable (e.g. relevant, culturally appropriate and of good quality) to students and, in appropriate cases, parents; this is subject to the educational objectives required by article 13 (1) and such minimum educational standards as may be approved by the State (see art. 13 (3) and (4));

d) **Adaptability** – education has to be flexible so it can adapt to the needs of changing societies and communities and respond to the needs of students within their diverse social and cultural settings.

7. When considering the appropriate application of these “interrelated and essential features” the best interests of the student shall be a primary consideration.

Article 13 (2) (a): The right to primary education

8. Primary education includes the elements of availability, accessibility, acceptability and adaptability which are common to education in all its forms and at all levels. (4)

9. The Committee obtains guidance on the proper interpretation of the term “primary education” from the World Declaration on Education for All which states:

“The main delivery system for the basic education of children outside the family is primary schooling. Primary education must be universal, ensure that the basic learning needs of all children are satisfied, and take into account the culture, needs and opportunities of the community” (art. 5). “Basic learning needs” are defined in article 1 of the World Declaration. (5) While primary education is not synonymous with basic education, there is a close correspondence between the two. In this regard, the Committee endorses the position taken by UNICEF: “Primary education is the most important component of basic education”. (6)

10. As formulated in article 13 (2) (a), primary education has two distinctive features: it is “compulsory” and “available free to all”. For the Committee’s observations on both terms, see paragraphs 6 and 7 of General Comment 11 on article 14 of the Covenant.

Article 13 (2) (b): The right to secondary education

- 11.** Secondary education includes the elements of availability, accessibility, acceptability and adaptability which are common to education in all its forms and at all levels. (7)
- 12.** While the content of secondary education will vary among States parties and over time, it includes completion of basic education and consolidation of the foundations for life-long learning and human development. It prepares students for vocational and higher educational opportunities. 8/ Article 13 (2) (b) applies to secondary education “in its different forms”, thereby recognizing that secondary education demands flexible curricula and varied delivery systems to respond to the needs of students in different social and cultural settings. The Committee encourages “alternative” educational programmes, which parallel regular secondary school systems.
- 13.** According to article 13 (2) (b), secondary education “shall be made generally available and accessible to all by every appropriate means, and in particular by the progressive introduction of free education”. The phrase “generally available” signifies, firstly, that secondary education is not dependent on a student’s apparent capacity or ability and, secondly, that secondary education will be distributed throughout the State in such a way that it is available on the same basis to all. For the Committee’s interpretation of “accessible”, see paragraph 6 above. The phrase “every appropriate means” reinforces the point that States parties should adopt varied and innovative approaches to the delivery of secondary education in different social and cultural contexts.
- 14.** “Progressive introduction of free education” means that while States must prioritize the provision of free primary education, they also have an obligation to take concrete steps towards achieving free secondary and higher education. For the Committee’s general observations on the meaning of the word “free”, see paragraph 7 of General Comment 11 on Article 14.

Technical and vocational education

- 15.** Technical and vocational education (TVE) forms part of both the right to education and the right to work (art. 6 (2)). Article 13 (2) (b) presents TVE as part of secondary education, reflecting the particular importance of TVE at

this level of education. Article 6 (2), however, does not refer to TVE in relation to a specific level of education; it comprehends that TVE has a wider role, helping “to achieve steady economic, social and cultural development and full and productive employment”. Also, the Universal Declaration of Human Rights states that “technical and professional education shall be made generally available” (art. 26 (1)). Accordingly, the Committee takes the view that TVE forms an integral element of all levels of education. (9)

- 16.** An introduction to technology and to the world of work should not be confined to specific TVE programmes but should be understood as a component of general education. According to the UNESCO Convention on Technical and Vocational Education (1989), TVE consists of “all forms and levels of the educational process involving, in addition to general knowledge, the study of technologies and related sciences and the acquisition of practical skills, know-how, attitudes and understanding relating to occupations in the various sectors of economic and social life” (art. 1 (a)). This view is also reflected in certain ILO Conventions. 10/ Understood in this way, the right to TVE includes the following aspects:
- a) It enables students to acquire knowledge and skills which contribute to their personal development, self-reliance and employability and enhances the productivity of their families and communities, including the State party’s economic and social development;
 - b) It takes account of the educational, cultural and social background of the population concerned; the skills, knowledge and levels of qualification needed in the various sectors of the economy; and occupational health, safety and welfare;
 - c) Provides retraining for adults whose current knowledge and skills have become obsolete owing to technological, economic, employment, social or other changes;
 - d) It consists of programmes which give students, especially those from developing countries, the opportunity to receive TVE in other States, with a view to the appropriate transfer and adaptation of technology;
 - e) It consists, in the context of the Covenant’s non-discrimination and equality provisions, of programmes which promote the TVE of women, girls, out-of-school youth, unemployed youth, the children of migrant workers, refugees, persons with disabilities and other disadvantaged groups.

Article 13 (2) (c): The right to higher education

17. Higher education includes the elements of availability, accessibility, acceptability and adaptability which are common to education in all its forms at all levels. (11)
18. While article 13 (2) (c) is formulated on the same lines as article 13 (2) (b), there are three differences between the two provisions. Article 13 (2) (c) does not include a reference to either education “in its different forms” or specifically to TVE. In the Committee’s opinion, these two omissions reflect only a difference of emphasis between article 13 (2) (b) and (c). If higher education is to respond to the needs of students in different social and cultural settings, it must have flexible curricula and varied delivery systems, such as distance learning; in practice, therefore, both secondary and higher education have to be available “in different forms”. As for the lack of reference in article 13 (2) (c) to technical and vocational education, given article 6 (2) of the Covenant and article 26 (1) of the Universal Declaration, TVE forms an integral component of all levels of education, including higher education. (12)
19. The third and most significant difference between article 13 (2) (b) and (c) is that while secondary education “shall be made generally available and accessible to all”, higher education “shall be made equally accessible to all, on the basis of capacity”. According to article 13 (2) (c), higher education is not to be “generally available”, but only available “on the basis of capacity”. The “capacity” of individuals should be assessed by reference to all their relevant expertise and experience.
20. So far as the wording of article 13 (2) (b) and (c) is the same (e.g. “the progressive introduction of free education”), see the previous comments on article 13 (2) (b).

Article 13 (2) (d): The right to fundamental education

21. Fundamental education includes the elements of availability, accessibility, acceptability and adaptability which are common to education in all its forms and at all levels. (13)
22. In general terms, fundamental education corresponds to basic education as set out in the World Declaration on Education For All. (14) By virtue of article 13 (2) (d),

individuals “who have not received or completed the whole period of their primary education” have a right to fundamental education, or basic education as defined in the World Declaration on Education For All.

23. Since everyone has the right to the satisfaction of their “basic learning needs” as understood by the World Declaration, the right to fundamental education is not confined to those “who have not received or completed the whole period of their primary education”. The right to fundamental education extends to all those who have not yet satisfied their “basic learning needs”.
24. It should be emphasized that enjoyment of the right to fundamental education is not limited by age or gender; it extends to children, youth and adults, including older persons. Fundamental education, therefore, is an integral component of adult education and life-long learning. Because fundamental education is a right of all age groups, curricula and delivery systems must be devised which are suitable for students of all ages.

Article 13 (2) (e): A school system; adequate fellowship system; material conditions of teaching staff

25. The requirement that the “development of a system of schools at all levels shall be actively pursued” means that a State party is obliged to have an overall developmental strategy for its school system. The strategy must encompass schooling at all levels, but the Covenant requires States parties to prioritize primary education (see para. 51). “Actively pursued” suggests that the overall strategy should attract a degree of governmental priority and, in any event, must be implemented with vigour.
26. The requirement that “an adequate fellowship system shall be established” should be read with the Covenant’s non-discrimination and equality provisions; the fellowship system should enhance equality of educational access for individuals from disadvantaged groups.
27. While the Covenant requires that “the material conditions of teaching staff shall be continuously improved”, in practice the general working conditions of teachers have deteriorated, and reached unacceptably low levels, in many States parties in recent years. Not only is this inconsistent with article 13 (2) (e), but it is also a major obstacle to the full realization of students’ right to education.

The Committee also notes the relationship between articles 13 (2) (e), 2 (2), 3 and 6-8 of the Covenant, including the right of teachers to organize and bargain collectively; draws the attention of States parties to the joint UNESCO-ILO Recommendation Concerning the Status of Teachers (1966) and the UNESCO Recommendation Concerning the Status of Higher-Education Teaching Personnel (1997); and urges States parties to report on measures they are taking to ensure that all teaching staff enjoy the conditions and status commensurate with their role.

Article 13 (3) and (4): The right to educational freedom

- 28.** Article 13 (3) has two elements, one of which is that States parties undertake to respect the liberty of parents and guardians to ensure the religious and moral education of their children in conformity with their own convictions. 15/ The Committee is of the view that this element of article 13 (3) permits public school instruction in subjects such as the general history of religions and ethics if it is given in an unbiased and objective way, respectful of the freedoms of opinion, conscience and expression. It notes that public education that includes instruction in a particular religion or belief is inconsistent with article 13 (3) unless provision is made for non-discriminatory exemptions or alternatives that would accommodate the wishes of parents and guardians.
- 29.** The second element of article 13 (3) is the liberty of parents and guardians to choose other than public schools for their children, provided the schools conform to “such minimum educational standards as may be laid down or approved by the State”. This has to be read with the complementary provision, article 13 (4), which affirms “the liberty of individuals and bodies to establish and direct educational institutions”, provided the institutions conform to the educational objectives set out in article 13 (1) and certain minimum standards. These minimum standards may relate to issues such as admission, curricula and the recognition of certificates. In their turn, these standards must be consistent with the educational objectives set out in article 13 (1).
- 30.** Under article 13 (4), everyone, including non-nationals, has the liberty to establish and direct educational institutions. The liberty also extends to “bodies”, i.e. legal persons or entities. It includes the right to establish and direct all types of educational institutions, including nurseries, universities and institutions for adult education. Given the principles of non-discrimination, equal opportunity

and effective participation in society for all, the State has an obligation to ensure that the liberty set out in article 13 (4) does not lead to extreme disparities of educational opportunity for some groups in society.

Article 13 : Special topics of broad application

Non-discrimination and equal treatment

- 31.** The prohibition against discrimination enshrined in article 2 (2) of the Covenant is subject to neither progressive realization nor the availability of resources; it applies full and immediately to all aspects of education and encompasses all internationally prohibited grounds of discrimination. The Committee interprets articles 2 (2) and 3 in the light of the UNESCO Convention against Discrimination in Education, the relevant provisions of the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women, the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination, the Convention on the Rights of the Child and the ILO Indigenous and Tribal Peoples Convention, 1989 (Convention No. 169), and wishes to draw particular attention to the following issues.
- 32.** The adoption of temporary special measures intended to bring about de facto equality or men and women and for disadvantaged groups is not a violation of the right to non-discrimination with regard to education, so long as such measures do not lead to the maintenance of unequal or separate standards for different groups, and provided they are not continued after the objectives for which they were taken have been achieved.
- 33.** In some circumstances, separate educational systems or institutions for groups defined by the categories in article 2 (2) shall be deemed not to constitute a breach of the Covenant. In this regard, the Committee affirms article 2 of the UNESCO Convention against Discrimination in Education (1960). 16/
- 34.** The Committee takes note of article 2 of the Convention on the Rights of the Child and article 3 (e) of the UNESCO Convention against Discrimination in Education and confirms that the principle of non-discrimination extends to all persons of school age residing in the territory of a State party, including non-nationals, and irrespective of their legal status.

35. Sharp disparities in spending policies that result in differing qualities of education for persons residing in different geographic locations may constitute discrimination under the Covenant.
36. The Committee affirms paragraph 35 of its General Comment 5, which addresses the issue of persons with disabilities in the context of the right to education, and paragraphs 36-42 of its General Comment 6, which address the issue of older persons in relation to articles 13-15 of the Covenant.
37. States parties must closely monitor education –including all relevant policies, institutions, programmes, spending patterns and other practices– so as to identify and take measures to redress any de facto discrimination. Educational data should be disaggregated by the prohibited grounds of discrimination.

Academic freedom and institutional autonomy 17/

38. In the light of its examination of numerous States parties' reports, the Committee has formed the view that the right to education can only be enjoyed if accompanied by the academic freedom of staff and students. Accordingly, even though the issue is not explicitly mentioned in article 13, it is appropriate and necessary for the Committee to make some observations about academic freedom. The following remarks give particular attention to institutions of higher education because, in the Committee's experience, staff and students in higher education are especially vulnerable to political and other pressures which undermine academic freedom. The Committee wishes to emphasize, however, that staff and students throughout the education sector are entitled to academic freedom and many of the following observations have general application.
39. Members of the academic community, individually or collectively, are free to pursue, develop and transmit knowledge and ideas, through research, teaching, study, discussion, documentation, production, creation or writing. Academic freedom includes the liberty of individuals to express freely opinions about the institution or system in which they work, to fulfil their functions without discrimination or fear of repression by the State or any other actor, to participate in professional or representative academic bodies, and to enjoy all the internationally recognized human rights applicable to other individuals in the same jurisdiction. The enjoyment of academic freedom carries with it

obligations, such as the duty to respect the academic freedom of others, to ensure the fair discussion of contrary views, and to treat all without discrimination on any of the prohibited grounds.

40. The enjoyment of academic freedom requires the autonomy of institutions of higher education. Autonomy is that degree of self-governance necessary for effective decision making by institutions of higher education in relation to their academic work, standards, management and related activities. Self-governance, however, must be consistent with systems of public accountability, especially in respect of funding provided by the State. Given the substantial public investments made in higher education, an appropriate balance has to be struck between institutional autonomy and accountability. While there is no single model, institutional arrangements should be fair, just and equitable, and as transparent and participatory as possible.

Discipline in schools (18)

41. In the Committee's view, corporal punishment is inconsistent with the fundamental guiding principle of international human rights law enshrined in the Preambles to the Universal Declaration of Human Rights and both Covenants: the dignity of the individual. 19/ Other aspects of school discipline may also be inconsistent with human dignity, such as public humiliation. Nor should any form of discipline breach other rights under the Covenant, such as the right to food. A State party is required to take measures to ensure that discipline which is inconsistent with the Covenant does not occur in any public or private educational institution within its jurisdiction. The Committee welcomes initiatives taken by some States parties which actively encourage schools to introduce "positive", non-violent approaches to school discipline.

Limitations on article 13

42. The Committee wishes to emphasize that the Covenant's limitations clause, article 4, is primarily intended to be protective of the rights of individuals rather than permissive of the imposition of limitations by the State. Consequently, a State party which closes a university or other educational institution on grounds such as national security or the preservation of public order has the burden of justifying such a serious measure in relation to each of the elements identified in article 4.

II. STATES PARTIES' OBLIGATIONS AND VIOLATIONS

General legal obligations

43. While the Covenant provides for progressive realization and acknowledges the constraints due to the limits of available resources, it also imposes on States parties various obligations which are of immediate effect. 20/ States parties have immediate obligations in relation to the right to education, such as the “guarantee” that the right “will be exercised without discrimination of any kind” (art. 2 (2)) and the obligation “to take steps” (art. 2 (1)) towards the full realization of article 13. 21/ Such steps must be “deliberate, concrete and targeted” towards the full realization of the right to education.
44. The realization of the right to education over time, that is “progressively”, should not be interpreted as depriving States parties’ obligations of all meaningful content. Progressive realization means that States parties have a specific and continuing obligation “to move as expeditiously and effectively as possible” towards the full realization of article 13. (22).
45. There is a strong presumption of impermissibility of any retrogressive measures taken in relation to the right to education, as well as other rights enunciated in the Covenant. If any deliberately retrogressive measures are taken, the State party has the burden of proving that they have been introduced after the most careful consideration of all alternatives and that they are fully justified by reference to the totality of the rights provided for in the Covenant and in the context of the full use of the State party’s maximum available resources. (23).
46. The right to education, like all human rights, imposes three types or levels of obligations on States parties: the obligations to respect, protect and fulfil. In turn, the obligation to fulfil incorporates both an obligation to facilitate and an obligation to provide.
47. The obligation to respect requires States parties to avoid measures that hinder or prevent the enjoyment of the right to education. The obligation to protect requires States parties to take measures that prevent third parties from interfering with the enjoyment of the right to education. The obligation to fulfil (facilitate) requires States to take positive measures that enable and assist individuals and communities to enjoy the right to education. Finally, States parties have an

obligation to fulfil (provide) the right to education. As a general rule, States parties are obliged to fulfil (provide) a specific right in the Covenant when an individual or group is unable, for reasons beyond their control, to realize the right themselves by the means at their disposal. However, the extent of this obligation is always subject to the text of the Covenant.

48. In this respect, two features of article 13 require emphasis. First, it is clear that article 13 regards States as having principal responsibility for the direct provision of education in most circumstances; States parties recognize, for example, that the “development of a system of schools at all levels shall be actively pursued” (art. 13 (2) (e)). Secondly, given the differential wording of article 13 (2) in relation to primary, secondary, higher and fundamental education, the parameters of a State party’s obligation to fulfil (provide) are not the same for all levels of education. Accordingly, in light of the text of the Covenant, States parties have an enhanced obligation to fulfil (provide) regarding the right to education, but the extent of this obligation is not uniform for all levels of education. The Committee observes that this interpretation of the obligation to fulfil (provide) in relation to article 13 coincides with the law and practice of numerous States parties.

Specific legal obligations

49. States parties are required to ensure that curricula, for all levels of the educational system, are directed to the objectives identified in article 13 (1). 24/ They are also obliged to establish and maintain a transparent and effective system which monitors whether or not education is, in fact, directed to the educational objectives set out in article 13 (1).
50. In relation to article 13 (2), States have obligations to respect, protect and fulfil each of the “essential features” (availability, accessibility, acceptability, adaptability) of the right to education. By way of illustration, a State must respect the availability of education by not closing private schools; protect the accessibility of education by ensuring that third parties, including parents and employers, do not stop girls from going to school; fulfil (facilitate) the acceptability of education by taking positive measures to ensure that education is culturally appropriate for minorities and indigenous peoples, and of good quality for all; fulfil (provide) the adaptability of education by designing and providing resources for curricula which reflect the contemporary needs of students in a changing world; and fulfil (provide) the availability of education by actively

developing a system of schools, including building classrooms, delivering programmes, providing teaching materials, training teachers and paying them domestically competitive salaries.

- 51.** As already observed, the obligations of States parties in relation to primary, secondary, higher and fundamental education are not identical. Given the wording of article 13 (2), States parties are obliged to prioritize the introduction of compulsory, free primary education. 25/ This interpretation of article 13 (2) is reinforced by the priority accorded to primary education in article 14. The obligation to provide primary education for all is an immediate duty of all States parties.
- 52.** In relation to article 13 (2) (b)-(d), a State party has an immediate obligation “to take steps” (art. 2 (1)) towards the realization of secondary, higher and fundamental education for all those within its jurisdiction. At a minimum, the State party is required to adopt and implement a national educational strategy which includes the provision of secondary, higher and fundamental education in accordance with the Covenant. This strategy should include mechanisms, such as indicators and benchmarks on the right to education, by which progress can be closely monitored.
- 53.** Under article 13 (2) (e), States parties are obliged to ensure that an educational fellowship system is in place to assist disadvantaged groups. 26/ The obligation to pursue actively the “development of a system of schools at all levels” reinforces the principal responsibility of States parties to ensure the direct provision of the right to education in most circumstances. (27)
- 54.** States parties are obliged to establish “minimum educational standards” to which all educational institutions established in accordance with article 13 (3) and (4) are required to conform. They must also maintain a transparent and effective system to monitor such standards. A State party has no obligation to fund institutions established in accordance with article 13 (3) and (4); however, if a State elects to make a financial contribution to private educational institutions, it must do so without discrimination on any of the prohibited grounds.
- 55.** States parties have an obligation to ensure that communities and families are not dependent on child labour. The Committee especially affirms the importance of education in eliminating child labour and the obligations set out in article 7 (2)

of the Worst Forms of Child Labour Convention, 1999 (Convention n° 182). 28/ Additionally, given article 2 (2), States parties are obliged to remove gender and other stereotyping which impedes the educational access of girls, women and other disadvantaged groups.

- 56.** In its General Comment 3, the Committee drew attention to the obligation of all States parties to take steps, “individually and through international assistance and cooperation, especially economic and technical”, towards the full realization of the rights recognized in the Covenant, such as the right to education. 29/ Articles 2 (1) and 23 of the Covenant, Article 56 of the Charter of the United Nations, article 10 of the World Declaration on Education for All, and Part I, paragraph 34 of the Vienna Declaration and Programme of Action all reinforce the obligation of States parties in relation to the provision of international assistance and cooperation for the full realization of the right to education. In relation to the negotiation and ratification of international agreements, States parties should take steps to ensure that these instruments do not adversely impact upon the right to education. Similarly, States parties have an obligation to ensure that their actions as members of international organizations, including international financial institutions, take due account of the right to education.
- 57.** In its General Comment 3, the Committee confirmed that States parties have “a minimum core obligation to ensure the satisfaction of, at the very least, minimum essential levels” of each of the rights enunciated in the Covenant, including “the most basic forms of education”. In the context of article 13, this core includes an obligation: to ensure the right of access to public educational institutions and programmes on a non-discriminatory basis ; to ensure that education conforms to the objectives set out in article 13 (1); to provide primary education for all in accordance with article 13 (2) (a); to adopt and implement a national educational strategy which includes provision for secondary, higher and fundamental education; and to ensure free choice of education without interference from the State or third parties, subject to conformity with “minimum educational standards” (art. 13 (3) and (4)).

Violations

- 58.** When the normative content of article 13 (Part I) is applied to the general and specific obligations of States parties (Part II), a dynamic process is set in motion which facilitates identification of violations of the right to education. Violations

of article 13 may occur through the direct action of States parties (acts of commission) or through their failure to take steps required by the Covenant (acts of omission).

- 59.** By way of illustration, violations of article 13 include: the introduction or failure to repeal legislation which discriminates against individuals or groups, on any of the prohibited grounds, in the field of education; the failure to take measures which address de facto educational discrimination; the use of curricula inconsistent with the educational objectives set out in article 13 (1); the failure to maintain a transparent and effective system to monitor conformity with article 13 (1); the failure to introduce, as a matter of priority, primary education which is compulsory and available free to all; the failure to take “deliberate, concrete and targeted” measures towards the progressive realization of secondary, higher and fundamental education in accordance with article 13 (2) (b)-(d); the prohibition of private educational institutions; the failure to ensure private educational institutions conform to the “minimum educational standards” required by article 13 (3) and (4); the denial of academic freedom of staff and students; the closure of educational institutions in times of political tension in non-conformity with article 4.

III. OBLIGATIONS OF ACTORS OTHER THAN STATES PARTIES

- 60.** Given article 22 of the Covenant, the role of the United Nations agencies, including at the country level through the United Nations Development Assistance Framework (UNDAF), is of special importance in relation to the realization of article 13. Coordinated efforts for the realization of the right to education should be maintained to improve coherence and interaction among all the actors concerned, including the various components of civil society. UNESCO, the United Nations Development Programme, UNICEF, ILO, the World Bank, the regional development banks, the International Monetary Fund and other relevant bodies within the United Nations system should enhance their cooperation for the implementation of the right to education at the national level, with due respect to their specific mandates, and building on their respective expertise. In particular, the international financial institutions, notably the World Bank and IMF, should pay greater attention to the protection of the right to education in their lending policies, credit agreements, structural adjustment programmes and measures taken in response to the debt crisis. 30/ When examining the reports of States parties, the Committee will consider

the effects of the assistance provided by all actors other than States parties on the ability of States to meet their obligations under article 13. The adoption of a human rights-based approach by United Nations specialized agencies, programmes and bodies will greatly facilitate implementation of the right to education.

Notes

***/ Contained in document E/C.12/1999/10.B**

1. The World Declaration on Education for All was adopted by 155 governmental delegations; the Vienna Declaration and Programme of Action was adopted by 171 governmental delegations; the Convention on the Rights of the Child has been ratified or acceded to by 191 States parties; the Plan of Action of the United Nations Decade for Human Rights Education was adopted by a consensus resolution of the General Assembly (49/184).
2. This approach corresponds with the Committee's analytical framework adopted in relation to the rights to adequate housing and food, as well as the work of the United Nations Special Rapporteur on the right to education. In its General Comment 4, the Committee identified a number of factors which bear upon the right to adequate housing, including "availability", "affordability", "accessibility" and "cultural adequacy". In its General Comment 12, the Committee identified elements of the right to adequate food, such as "availability", "acceptability" and "accessibility". In her preliminary report to the Commission on Human Rights, the Special Rapporteur on the right to education sets out "four essential features that primary schools should exhibit, namely availability, accessibility, acceptability and adaptability", (E/CN.4/1999/49, para. 50).
3. See para. 6.
4. The Declaration defines "basic learning needs" as: "essential learning tools (such as literacy, oral expression, numeracy, and problem solving) and the basic learning content (such as knowledge, skills, values, and attitudes) required by human beings to be able to survive, to develop their full capacities, to live and work in dignity, to participate fully in development, to improve the quality of their lives, to make informed decisions, and to continue learning" (art. 1).
5. Advocacy Kit, Basic Education 1999 (UNICEF), section 1, p. 1.
6. See para. 6.
7. See International Standard Classification of Education 1997, UNESCO, para. 52.

8. A view also reflected in the Human Resources Development Convention 1975 (Convention n° 142) and the Social Policy (Basic Aims and Standards) Convention 1962 (Convention n° 117) of the International Labour Organization.
9. See note 8.
10. See para. 6.
11. See para. 15.
12. See para. 6.
13. See para. 9.
14. This replicates article 18 (4) of the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (ICCPR) and also relates to the freedom to teach a religion or belief as stated in article 18 (1) ICCPR. (See Human Rights Committee General Comment 22 on article 18 ICCPR, forty-eighth session, 1993.) The Human Rights Committee notes that the fundamental character of article 18 ICCPR is reflected in the fact that this provision cannot be derogated from, even in time of public emergency, as stated in article 4 (2) of that Covenant.
15. According to article 2: “When permitted in a State, the following situations shall not be deemed to constitute discrimination, within the meaning of article 1 of this Convention:
 - a) The establishment or maintenance of separate educational systems or institutions for pupils of the two sexes, if these systems or institutions offer equivalent access to education, provide a teaching staff with qualifications of the same standard as well as school premises and equipment of the same quality, and afford the opportunity to take the same or equivalent courses of study;
 - b) The establishment or maintenance, for religious or linguistic reasons, of separate educational systems or institutions offering an education which is in keeping with the wishes of the pupil’s parents or legal guardians, if participation in such systems or attendance at such institutions is optional and if the education provided conforms to such standards as may be laid down or approved by the competent authorities, in particular for education of the same level;

- c) The establishment or maintenance of private educational institutions, if the object of the institutions is not to secure the exclusion of any group but to provide educational facilities in addition to those provided by the public authorities, if the institutions are conducted in accordance with that object, and if the education provided conforms with such standards as may be laid down or approved by the competent authorities, in particular for education of the same level”.
16. See UNESCO Recommendation Concerning the Status of Higher-Education Teaching Personnel (1997).
 17. In formulating this paragraph, the Committee has taken note of the practice evolving elsewhere in the international human rights system, such as the interpretation given by the Committee on the Rights of the Child to article 28 (2) of the Convention on the Rights of the Child, as well as the Human Rights Committee’s interpretation of article 7 of ICCPR.
 18. The Committee notes that, although it is absent from article 26 (2) of the Declaration, the drafters of ICESCR expressly included the dignity of the human personality as one of the mandatory objectives to which all education is to be directed (art. 13 (1)).
 19. See the Committee’s General Comment 3, para. 1.
 20. See the Committee’s General Comment 3, para. 2.
 21. See the Committee’s General Comment 3, para. 9.
 22. See the Committee’s General Comment 3, para. 9.
 23. There are numerous resources to assist States parties in this regard, such as UNESCO’s Guidelines for Curriculum and Textbook Development in International Education (ED/ECS/HCI). One of the objectives of article 13 (1) is to “strengthen the respect of human rights and fundamental freedoms”; in this particular context, States parties should examine the initiatives developed within the framework of the United Nations Decade for Human Rights Education – especially instructive is the Plan of Action for the Decade, adopted by the General Assembly in 1996, and the Guidelines for National Plans of Action for

Human Rights Education, developed by the Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights to assist States in responding to the United Nations Decade for Human Rights Education.

24. On the meaning of “compulsory” and “free”, see paragraphs 6 and 7 of General Comment 11 on article 14.
25. In appropriate cases, such a fellowship system would be an especially appropriate target for the international assistance and cooperation anticipated by article 2 (1).
26. In the context of basic education, UNICEF has observed: “Only the State can pull together all the components into a coherent but flexible education system”. UNICEF, *The State of the World’s Children, 1999*, “The education revolution”, p. 77.
27. According to article 7 (2), “each Member shall, taking into account the importance of education in eliminating child labour, take effective and time-bound measures to: (c) ensure access to free basic education, and, wherever possible and appropriate, vocational training, for all children removed from the worst forms of child labour” (ILO Convention 182, *Worst Forms of Child Labour, 1999*).
28. See the Committee’s General Comment 3, paras. 13-14.
29. See the Committee’s General Comment 2, para. 9.