



Last updated: 08/02/2016

RIGHT TO EDUCATION INDICATORS

Disclaimer! This list of indicators is not definitive. It is a work in progress. Our aim is to ensure that we have the most comprehensive and practical list of indicators to monitor the right to education. To achieve this, we will be testing and piloting these indicators in various countries across different issues. Our plan is to find out which ones work, which don't and which need to be adapted. In due course, we will also add indicators and develop indicators on emerging issues.

We invite you to contribute to this process by submitting feedback on this list. Please tell us what we have missed, which indicators you find informative (or not!) on the right to education, and on which topics you'd like to see indicators developed. All feedback is welcome.

Submit feedback, here: <http://www.right-to-education.org/monitoring/content/contact-us>

Visit the Right to Education Project's *Guide to Monitoring the Right to Education Using Indicators*, here: www.right-to-education.org/monitoring

Indicators:

Primary net enrolment rate (%)	8
Gross enrolment ratio (GER) (%)	8
Out-of-school children rate	9
Primary completion rate (%)	10
Enrolment in technical/vocational education programmes as a percentage of total secondary enrolment	11
Secondary completion rate (%)	12
Tertiary completion rate (first degree) (%)	12
Adult literacy rate (%)	13
Percentage of secondary school students in their final year who pass the requisite examinations	14
Mean performance on the reading scale	14
Mean performance on the mathematics scale	15
Mean performance on the science scale	16
Percentage of students at the lowest level of reading proficiency	17
Percentage of students at the lowest level of mathematics proficiency	17
Percentage of students at the lowest level of science proficiency	18
Repetition rate	19
Percentage of private enrolment	19
Are measures taken to enhance parents' understanding of the importance of their children's early education?	20
Percentage of schools with buildings in a state of disrepair	21
Percentage of schools that have a shortage of classrooms	21
Percentage of schools with potable water	22
Percentage of schools without toilets	23
Percentage of schools without single-sex toilets	23
Percentage of schools without electricity	24
Percentage of schools without access to a library	24
Percentage of schools without computer facilities	25
Percentage of schools without fire exits	25
Percentage of schools without first-aid kits	26
Pupil/teacher ratio	26
Are there transparent procedures for the hiring process of teachers and for contracts/tenders for education services?	27
Number of years of education required for teachers to meet certification requirements	27

Number of years of higher education required for qualified teachers	28
Percentage of trained teachers	28
Percentage of teachers with social security benefits	29
Teachers' union density rate	29
Teachers' salary rate	30
Do teachers enjoy academic freedom?	30
Number of reported incidents of repression against teachers for their political, ideological or religious beliefs or teachers' union activity	31
Percentage of the population for whom school-house distance is more than 5 km	31
Percentage of household expenditure on education	32
Is there a special funding system to ensure access to education for students from marginalised groups?	32
Pupil/textbook ratio	33
Do children have to present a birth certificate to enrol in school?	33
Can children of seasonal migrants enrol in schools?	34
Is the State taking steps to identify out-of-school children, to encourage school attendance and to reduce drop-out rates?	34
Are there established mechanisms to enable parents, children and community leaders to contribute to the formulation and/or implementation of strategies to identify out-of-school children, to encourage school attendance and to reduce drop-out rates?	35
Are there any specific measures to ensure that previously out-of-school children remain in school?	36
Are there minimum educational standards applicable to non-government schools?	36
Is there a monitoring body controlling whether minimum educational standards are met in private schools?	37
Are there any established mechanisms that enable parents, children and/or community leaders to contribute to defining school curricula?	37
Do curriculum guidelines provided by the Ministry of Education include promoting respect for other nations, racial, ethnic or religious groups and indigenous peoples?	38
Are there any established mechanisms to ensure that textbooks used in both public and private schools are of good quality and aligned with the curriculum guidelines provided by the Ministry of Education?	38
Do the guidelines for the approval of textbooks that can be used in schools include the prohibition of any kind of promotion or depiction of discriminatory views?	39
Is there a monitoring mechanism charged with determining whether teachers have a good command of the language in which they teach?	39
Does the required training for teachers include improving the skills necessary for teaching according to the aims of education set out in international human rights standards?	40
Do teachers have access to continual professional development throughout their careers?	40

Are there incentives to encourage experienced and/or well-trained teachers to teach in schools or areas where educational outcomes are traditionally lower?	41
International human rights treaties relevant to the right to education ratified by the State	41
Coverage of the right to education in the constitution or other forms of superior law	42
Coverage of the right to education in domestic law	43
Do domestic laws forbid discrimination in access to education?	43
Number of reported incidents of schools closed or not allowed to open	43
Teacher absenteeism rate	44
Has the government adopted specific measures to combat teacher absenteeism?	44
Are there campaigns to convince parents to send their girls to school?	45
Gender pay gap	45
Is there legislation prohibiting child marriage?	46
Number of reported incidents of child marriage	46
Percentage of female teachers, headteachers and supervisors	46
Is the expulsion of girls from school because of pregnancy or for having a baby explicitly forbidden in legislation?	47
Number of reported incidents of girls expelled from schools because of pregnancy or having had a baby	47
Number of reported incidents of expulsion of unmarried, pregnant schoolteachers	48
Do domestic laws protect the right of minorities to establish their own schools?	48
Percentage of children belonging to language minorities taught both their own minority language and the official State language	49
Number of reported incidents of racism or xenophobia in schools	49
Minority teachers ratio	50
Percentage of teachers not belonging to minority groups trained in minority culture or languages	50
Are there established mechanisms to enable parents, children and community leaders belonging to minorities to contribute to ensuring that education takes their needs into account?	51
Are there mobile schools for children of nomads?	51
Is there legislation recognising the right of children with disabilities to education?	51
Percentage of children with disabilities enrolled in mainstream schools	52
Is there a special funding system to ensure access to education for children with disabilities?	52
Are reasonable accommodation measures available for children with disabilities in mainstream schools?	53
Trained teachers rate for children with disabilities	53
Do teachers of children with disabilities in mainstream schools receive special support?	54
Percentage of children with disabilities enrolled in special schools	54

Can parents and children complain before an independent body about decisions to send their children to special schools?	55
Percentage of household expenditure on education for households with children with disabilities	55
Do migrant, refugee, internally displaced or other 'internal migrant' children have to present documents stating their legal status to enrol in school?	55
Number of reported incidents of migrant, refugee, internally displaced children expelled from school because they or their parents have lost their residency permit	56
Is education provided in retention centres/camps for migrant, refugee and internally displaced children?	56
Do imprisoned children receive education integrated with the general education system?	57
Is educational and vocational information and guidance given to imprisoned children?	57
Do adult prisoners have access to education?	58
Percentage of prisons with libraries	58
Is there legislation expressly prohibiting any form of discrimination against students and teachers affected by HIV/AIDS?	58
Number of reported incidents of discrimination against children because they or their parents are HIV-positive or against teachers who are HIV-positive	59
Are there any government programmes that provide children, families, teachers, educational officials and the broader community with factual and comprehensive information about HIV/AIDS?	59
Is corporal punishment illegal?	59
Can abused children complain before an independent body?	60
Number of reported incidents of corporal punishment in schools	61
Number of reported incidents of violence in schools	61
Number of reported incidents of sexual harassment	62
Reported cases of incidents regarding safety of students to and from school	62
What is the legal minimum age of employment?	63
Percentage of children under minimum legal age of employment working in practice	63
Is there a monitoring body inspecting child labour?	63
Has the government adopted specific measures to combat child labour?	64
Are there special measures to include child labourers in education and find solutions for them and their families?	64
Number of reported incidents of use of schools by armed forces	65
Number of reported military attacks on schools	65
Number of reported incidents of military attacks on students and teachers	66
What is the legal minimum age of military recruitment?	66
Number of child soldiers	67

Are there special programmes available to reintegrate demobilised child soldiers in the education system?	67
Is children's education ensured by the occupying power?	67
Are children prisoners-of-war given the means to pursue their educational activities?	68
Does the State have a plan on how to comply with minimum educational standards during natural disasters?	68
If a natural disaster occurred in the last 5 years, did the State respond adequately to ensure minimum educational standards?	68
Education expenditure ratio	69
Current public expenditure per pupil as a percentage of GDP per capita	69
Public expenditure ratio	70
Education allocation ratio	70
Primary education priority ratio	71
Does an independent body (eg parliamentary committee) monitor the budget?	71
Is there public access to key public financial documents related to education?	72
Percentage of State activities in education funded through extrabudgetary sources	72
Education budget execution rate	73
Does the State take steps to seek international assistance and cooperation for the realisation of the right to education?	74
Are there effective mechanisms to ensure that civil society organisations are consulted when multilateral or bilateral agreements that have an effect on the right to education are negotiated?	74
Do domestic laws protect the right to establish private schools?	74
Is there a private school accreditation system?	75
Do domestic laws expressly recognise the liberty of parents to choose the religious and moral education of their children in conformity with their own convictions?	75
Number of reported incidents in which a school has not provided for specific accommodation of children's religious or moral convictions	76
Is there a monitoring body overseeing whether schools respect religious freedom?	76
Is there a school inspection system?	77
Frequency of inspection visits	77
Is there a State body responsible for monitoring the education system?	78
Does the State regularly gather data on education?	78
Do civil society organisations face obstacles set by the State when monitoring the right to education?	78
Is the education data gathered by the State publicly available?	79
Does the State body responsible for monitoring the education system produce regular and publicly available reports on the state of education?	79

Are the criteria used to select the schools or children that benefit from targeted programmes publicly available?	80
Does the State have effective administrative complaint mechanism(s) to file complaints on violations of the right to education?	80
Number of administrative complaints on the right to education	81
Proportion of received complaints on the right to education that have been investigated by an administrative body	82
Number of court cases on the right to education	82
Proportion of court cases where it has been determined that there has been a violation of the right to education	83
If the educational system is decentralised, are the responsibilities of each level of government for education clearly defined and available to the public?	84
If the educational system is decentralised, is the distribution of funds for education from national to local level commensurate with the responsibilities devolved to the local level?	84
If financing of some aspects of the educational system depends on revenues collected by local authorities, is there an effective system to ensure that local authorities that cannot afford it are able to provide basic education services?	85
If the educational system is decentralised, does the national government provide capacity-building for local administrators, policymakers and education workers?	85

Primary net enrolment rate (%)

Definition: Net enrolment rate is the number of children of official school age (based on the International Standard Classification of Education 1997) who are enrolled in school as a percentage of the population of the corresponding official school age

Comments: A high net enrolment rate (NER) denotes a high degree of enrolment in education by the official school-age population. NERs below 100% provide a measure of the proportion of primary school age children who are not enrolled at the primary level. This difference does not necessarily indicate the percentage of students who are not enrolled at all in education, since some children may be enrolled at other levels of education. When the NER is compared with the gross enrolment ratio (GER) the difference between the two ratios highlights the incidence of under-aged and over-aged enrolment. The data for this indicator should be disaggregated to measure relative enjoyment across and between groups, for example boys compared to girls, persons with disabilities compared to the general population and those living in different regions of the country. Inequalities in enjoyment may constitute discrimination

(Source: Sustainable Development Knowledge Platform, *Net Enrolment Rate in Primary Education*: http://www.un.org/esa/sustdev/natlinfo/indicators/methodology_sheets/education/net_enrolment.pdf)

Levels of disaggregation: Gender, Income, Minority, Region, Urban/Rural, Minority, Persons with Disabilities, Persons with HIV/AIDS, Migrants, Refugees and IDPs, Persons in Detention, Child Labourers, Child Soldiers, Public/Private

Available data: *Edstats* (SEARCH: Series > Topics > Primary > Enrolment Rates): <http://databank.worldbank.org/data/reports.aspx?source=Education%20Statistics>

Human rights standards: Article 13 (2) (a), International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Article 28 (1) (a), Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 17 (2), (Revised) European Social Charter; Article 13 (3) (a), Protocol of San Salvador; Article 11 (3) (a), African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child; Article 41 (2), Arab Charter

Tags: Armed Conflict (Including Child Soldiers), Natural Disasters, Access to Education, Free Education, Educational Freedom/Private Education, Primary, Women and Girls, Indigenous Peoples and Minorities, Persons with Disabilities, Persons with HIV/AIDS, Migrants, Refugees and IDPs, Persons in Detention, Persons Living in Poverty, Child Labourers, Outcome Indicators

Gross enrolment ratio (GER) (%)

Definition: GER is the ratio of total enrolment, regardless of age, to the population of the age group that corresponds to the same level of education. GER can exceed 100% due to the inclusion of over-aged and under-aged students, because of early or late school entrance, and grade repetition. For the tertiary level, the population used is the 5-year age group

starting from the official secondary school graduation age (Source: UIS, *Education Indicators - Technical Guidelines*: <http://www.uis.unesco.org/Library/Documents/eiquide09-en.pdf>: p.9)

Comments: Gross enrolment ratio is widely used to show the general level of participation in a given level of education. It can also be used as a complementary indicator to net enrolment rate (NER) by indicating the extent of over-aged and under-aged enrolment. The data for this indicator should be disaggregated to measure relative enjoyment across and between groups, for example boys compared to girls, persons with disabilities compared to the general population and those living in different regions of the country. Inequalities in enjoyment may constitute discrimination (Source: UIS, *Education Indicators - Technical Guidelines*: <http://www.uis.unesco.org/Library/Documents/eiquide09-en.pdf>: p.9)

Levels of disaggregation: Level of Education, Gender, Income, Minority, Region, Urban/Rural, Persons with Disabilities, Persons with HIV/AIDS, Migrants, Refugees and IDPs, Persons in Detention, Child Labourers, Child Soldiers, Public/Private

Available data: *Edstats*: <http://databank.worldbank.org/data/reports.aspx?source=Education%20Statistics>

Human rights standards: Article 13 (2), International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Article 28 (1), Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 24 (2), Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities; Article 7 (2) (c), ILO Convention 182; Article 17 (2), (Revised) European Social Charter; Article 13 (3), Protocol of San Salvador; Article 11 (3), African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child, Article 13 (4), African Youth Charter; Article 41 (2), Arab Charter; Article 4, UNESCO Convention against Discrimination in Education

Tags: Armed Conflict (Including Child Soldiers), Natural Disasters, Access to Education, Free Education, Educational Freedom/Private Education, Pre-Primary, Primary, Secondary, Higher Education, Women and Girls, Indigenous Peoples and Minorities, Persons with Disabilities, Persons with HIV/AIDS, Migrants, Refugees and IDPs, Persons in Detention, Persons Living in Poverty, Child Labourers, Outcome Indicators

Out-of-school children rate

Definition: Total primary (or secondary) school age children who are not enrolled (because they never enrolled or because they dropped-out) in primary or secondary education expressed as a percentage of the official school-age population corresponding to the primary (or secondary) level in a given school-year. Children enrolled in pre-primary education are excluded and considered out-of-school

(Source: UIS: <http://glossary.uis.unesco.org/glossary/en/term/2630/en>)

Comments: A high rate of out-of-school children indicates that the State is failing to achieve universal primary and secondary education. Data for this indicator should be disaggregated to show which groups are excluded from education. If the data show, for example, that girls are more likely to be out-of-school or that children with disabilities are less likely to be enrolled or drop-out than the general population, this is an indication that the State's efforts

to achieve universal primary (and secondary education) are insufficient and in some cases, discriminatory

Levels of disaggregation: Level of Education, Gender, Income, Minority, Region, Urban/Rural, Minority, Persons with Disabilities, Persons with HIV/AIDS, Migrants, Refugees and IDPs, Persons in Detention, Child Labourers, Child Soldiers

Available data: UIS has data on out-of-school rates at the primary and lower secondary levels (Education>Out-of-school children): <http://data.uis.unesco.org/Index.aspx?queryid=120>. Alternatively, see *Universal Primary and Secondary Education by 2030! But Where Do We Stand Today? - Explore the Data* for a visual representation of UIS data: <http://www.right-to-education.org/news/universal-primary-and-secondary-education-2030-where-do-we-stand-today-explore-data>. The *All in School Initiative* also provides data by region and the barriers to accessing education: <http://allinschool.org/>

Human rights standards: Article 13 (2), International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Article 28 (1), Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 24 (2), Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities; Article 7 (2) (c), ILO Convention 182; Article 17 (2), (Revised) European Social Charter; Article 13 (3), Protocol of San Salvador; Article 11 (3), African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child, Article 13 (4), African Youth Charter; Article 41 (2), Arab Charter; Article 4, UNESCO Convention against Discrimination in Education

Tags: Armed Conflict (Including Child Soldiers), Natural Disasters, Access to Education, Free Education, Primary, Secondary, Women and Girls, Indigenous Peoples and Minorities, Persons with Disabilities, Persons with HIV/AIDS, Migrants, Refugees and IDPs, Persons in Detention, Persons Living in Poverty, Child Labourers, Outcome Indicators

Primary completion rate (%)

Definition: Primary completion rate is the percentage of students completing the last year of primary school. The UN defines it as: the total number of new entrants in the last grade of primary education, regardless of age, expressed as percentage of the total population of the theoretical entrance age to the last grade of primary. The ratio can exceed 100% due to over-aged and under-aged children who enter primary school late / early and / or repeat grades

Comments: A primary completion rate of less than 100% is indicative of a problem in the State's obligation to fulfil the right to free and compulsory primary education. The data for this indicator should be disaggregated to measure relative enjoyment across and between groups, for example boys compared to girls, persons with disabilities compared to the general population and those living in different regions of the country. Inequalities in enjoyment may constitute discrimination

Levels of disaggregation: Gender, Income, Region, Urban/Rural, Minority, Persons with Disabilities, Persons with HIV/AIDS, Migrants, Refugees and IDPs, Persons in Detention, Child Labourers, Child Soldiers, Public/Private

Available data: *World Development Indicators:* <http://data.worldbank.org/indicator/SE.PRM.CMPT.ZS>

Human rights standards: Article 13 (2) (a), International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Article 28 (1) (a) (e), Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 24 (2), Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities; Article 7 (2) (c), ILO Convention 182; Article 17 (2), (Revised) European Social Charter; Article 13 (3) (a) (d), Protocol of San Salvador; Article 11 (3) (a) (d), African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child, Article 13 (4) (a) (c), African Youth Charter; Article 41 (2), Arab Charter; Article 4 (a), UNESCO Convention against Discrimination in Education

Tags: Armed Conflict (Including Child Soldiers), Natural Disasters, Access to Education, Free Education, Educational Freedom/Private Education, Primary, Women and Girls, Indigenous Peoples and Minorities, Persons with Disabilities, Persons with HIV/AIDS, Migrants, Refugees and IDPs, Persons in Detention, Persons Living in Poverty, Child Labourers, Outcome Indicators

Enrolment in technical/vocational education programmes as a percentage of total secondary enrolment

Definition: Technical / vocational enrolment as a percentage of total secondary enrolment is the percentage of secondary students enrolled in technical / vocational education programmes, including teacher training programmes

Comments: Low technical / vocational enrolment as a percentage of total secondary enrolment may suggest that technical and vocational secondary education is not made generally available and accessible to all, in contravention of international human rights standards. The data for this indicator should be disaggregated to measure relative enjoyment across and between groups, for example boys compared to girls, persons with disabilities compared to the general population and those living in different regions of the country. Inequalities in enjoyment may constitute discrimination

Levels of disaggregation: Gender, Income, Minority, Region, Urban/Rural, Persons with Disabilities, Persons with HIV/AIDS, Migrants, Refugees and IDPs, Persons in Detention, Public/Private, Child Labourers, Child Soldiers

Available data: *Edstats:* <http://databank.worldbank.org/data/reports.aspx?source=Education%20Statistics>

Human rights standards: Articles 13 (2) (b) & 6 (2), International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Article 28 (1) (b), Convention on the Rights of the Child; Articles 9, 10 & 17 (2), (Revised) European Social Charter; Article 13 (3) (b), Protocol of San Salvador; Article 11 (3) (b), African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child; Article 31 (2), Arab Charter, UNESCO Convention on Technical and Vocational Training; Article 7 (2) (c), ILO

Convention 182; Article 22 (2), ILO Convention 169; Article 14 (1), European Union Charter of Fundamental Rights

Tags: Armed Conflict (Including Child Soldiers), Natural Disasters, Access to Education, Free Education, Secondary, Vocational Education, Women and Girls, Indigenous Peoples and Minorities, Persons with Disabilities, Persons with HIV/AIDS, Migrants, Refugees and IDPs, Persons in Detention, Persons Living in Poverty, Child Labourers, Outcome Indicators

Secondary completion rate (%)

Definition: Secondary completion rate is the total number of graduates from the last grade of secondary education, regardless of age, expressed as a percentage of the population of the age group that officially corresponds to that of graduating from secondary schools

Comments: A low level of this indicator may be indicative that the State is not taking all necessary steps to progressively realise universal secondary education according to maximum available resources. The data for this indicator should be disaggregated to measure relative enjoyment across and between groups, for example boys compared to girls, persons with disabilities compared to the general population and those living in different regions of the country. Inequalities in enjoyment may constitute discrimination

Levels of disaggregation: Gender, Income, Minority, Region, Urban/Rural, Persons with Disabilities, Persons with HIV/AIDS, Migrants, Refugees and IDPs, Persons in Detention, Child Soldiers, Public/Private, Child Labourers

Available data: Edstats: <http://databank.worldbank.org/data/reports.aspx?source=Education%20Statistics>

Human rights standards: Article 13 (2) (b), International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Article 28 (1) (b), Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 24 (2), Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities; Article 4 (a), UNESCO Convention against Discrimination in Education, Article 11 (3) (b), African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child; Article 13 (4) (b), African Youth Charter; Article 13 (3) (b), Additional Protocol to the American Convention on Human Rights, Article 13 (3) (b), Protocol of San Salvador; Article 17 (2), (Revised) European Social Charter

Tags: Armed Conflict (Including Child Soldiers), Natural Disasters, Access to Education, Free Education, Educational Freedom/Private Education, Secondary, Women and Girls, Indigenous Peoples and Minorities, Persons with Disabilities, Persons with HIV/AIDS, Migrants, Refugees and IDPs, Persons in Detention, Persons Living in Poverty, Child Labourers, Outcome Indicators

Tertiary completion rate (first degree) (%)

Definition: Gross tertiary graduation ratio (only applicable for first degrees) is the total number of graduates in tertiary International Standard Classification of Education (ISCED) 5A programmes expressed as a percentage of the total population of the age at which students theoretically finish their first degree programme, in a given country

Comments: A low level of this indicator may be indicative that the State is not taking all necessary steps to make higher education equally accessible to all, on the basis of capacity, by every appropriate means. The data for this indicator should be disaggregated to measure relative enjoyment across and between groups, for example boys compared to girls, persons with disabilities compared to the general population and those living in different regions of the country. Inequalities in enjoyment may constitute discrimination

Levels of disaggregation: Gender, Income, Minority, Region, Urban/Rural, Persons with Disabilities, Persons with HIV/AIDS, Migrants, Refugees and IDPs, Public/Private

Available data: UIS: <http://data.uis.unesco.org/Index.aspx?queryid=162>

Human rights standards: Article 13 (2) (c), International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Article 28 (1) (c), Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 13 (3) (c), Protocol of San Salvador; Article 11 (3) (c), African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child

Tags: Armed Conflict (Including Child Soldiers), Natural Disasters, Access to Education, Free Education, Higher Education, Women and Girls, Indigenous Peoples and Minorities, Persons with Disabilities, Persons with HIV/AIDS, Migrants, Refugees and IDPs, Persons in Detention, Persons Living in Poverty, Outcome Indicators

Adult literacy rate (%)

Definition: Percentage of population aged 15 years and over who can, with understanding, both read and write, a short simple statement on his / her everyday life. Generally, 'literacy' also encompasses 'numeracy', the ability to make simple arithmetic calculations (Source: UIS: <http://www.uis.unesco.org/Library/Documents/eiguide09-en.pdf>: p.3)

Comments: A high illiteracy rate (or low literacy rate) suggests the existence of serious shortcomings in the primary education system and / or literacy programmes that have prevented a large proportion of the population from acquiring the ability to use the written word (and making simple arithmetic calculations) in daily life and to continue learning. It is important to remember that literacy rates look backwards, if you encounter a low literacy rate you should make an assessment of factors that may have affected education in the past, such as inadequate financing, armed conflict and other emergency situations, etc. The data for this indicator should be disaggregated to measure relative enjoyment across and between groups, for example boys compared to girls, persons with disabilities compared to the general population and those living in different regions of the country. Inequalities in enjoyment may constitute discrimination

Levels of disaggregation: Gender, Income, Minority, Region, Urban/Rural, Persons with Disabilities, Persons with HIV/AIDS, Migrants, Refugees and IDPs, Age

Available data: Edstats: <http://databank.worldbank.org/data/reports.aspx?source=education-statistics>

Human rights standards: Article 28 (3), Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 13 (2), International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Article 10 (e), Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women; Article 41 (1), Arab Charter; Article 12 (2) (a), Protocol to the African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights on the Rights of Women in Africa; Article 13 (4) (g), African Youth Charter; Articles 34 (h) & 50, Charter of the Organisation of American States

Tags: Access to Education, Quality of Education, Learning Outcomes, Primary, Secondary, Adult Education, Women and Girls, Indigenous Peoples and Minorities, Persons with Disabilities, Persons with HIV/AIDS, Migrants, Refugees and IDPs, Persons Living in Poverty, Outcome Indicators

Percentage of secondary school students in their final year who pass the requisite examinations

Definition: The percentage of students who achieve the lowest passable grade or above in examinations taking place in the final year of secondary school (Source: Audrey Chapman (2007) *Development of Indicators for Economic, Social and Cultural Rights: The Rights to Education, Participation in Cultural Life and Access to the Benefits of Science*: p.152)

Comments: A low percentage may be indicative of poor learning outcomes, which in turn may be indicative of an inadequate quality of education. The data for this indicator should be disaggregated to measure relative enjoyment across and between groups, for example boys compared to girls, persons with disabilities compared to the general population and those living in different regions of the country. Inequalities in enjoyment may constitute discrimination

Levels of disaggregation: Gender, Income, Minority, Region, Urban/Rural, Persons with Disabilities, Persons with HIV/AIDS, Migrants, Refugees and IDPs, Persons in Detention, Public/Private, Child Labourers

Available data:

Human rights standards: Article 13 (1) (2) (3) (a), African Youth Charter; Article 29 (1) (a), Convention on the Rights of the Child

Tags: Armed Conflict (Including Child Soldiers), Natural Disasters, Quality of Education, Educational Freedom/Private Education, Secondary, Women and Girls, Indigenous Peoples and Minorities, Persons with Disabilities, Persons with HIV/AIDS, Migrants, Refugees and IDPs, Persons in Detention, Persons Living in Poverty, Child Labourers, Outcome Indicators

Mean performance on the reading scale

Definition: Mean performance on the reading scale is the mean reading score for students in national or international assessments

Comments: A low mean value may be indicative of a general problem in the quality of education. The data for this indicator should be disaggregated to measure relative

enjoyment across and between groups, for example boys compared to girls and those living in different regions of the country. Inequalities in enjoyment may constitute discrimination. For this indicator it is important, when monitoring the right to education of persons with disabilities, to disaggregate the data by type of disability because for some types of disability there should be equality of learning outcomes, whilst for others measuring learning outcomes is not an adequate measure of the quality of education

Levels of disaggregation: Gender, Income, Minority, Region, Urban/Rural, Persons with Disabilities, Persons with HIV/AIDS, Migrants, Refugees and IDPs, Persons in Detention, Public/Private, Child Labourers, Level of Education

Available data: For data on learning outcomes, as measured by international assessments, see *Edstats* (SEARCH: Series > Topics > Learning Outcomes):
<http://databank.worldbank.org/data/reports.aspx?source=Education%20Statistics>

Human rights standards: Article 13, International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Article 28, Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 17 (2), (Revised) European Social Charter; Article 13, Protocol of San Salvador; Article 11, African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child; Article 13, African Youth Charter; Article 41 (2), Arab Charter; Article 4, UNESCO Convention against Discrimination in Education

Tags: Armed Conflict (Including Child Soldiers), Natural Disasters, Quality of Education, Learning Outcomes, Educational Freedom/Private Education, Primary, Secondary, Women and Girls, Indigenous Peoples and Minorities, Persons with Disabilities, Persons with HIV/AIDS, Migrants, Refugees and IDPs, Persons in Detention, Persons Living in Poverty, Child Labourers, Outcome Indicators

Mean performance on the mathematics scale

Definition: Mean performance on the mathematics scale is the mean mathematics score for students in national or international assessments

Comments: A low mean value may be indicative of a general problem in the quality of education. The data for this indicator should be disaggregated to measure relative enjoyment across and between groups, for example boys compared to girls and those living in different regions of the country. Inequalities in enjoyment may constitute discrimination. For this indicator it is important, when monitoring the right to education of persons with disabilities, to disaggregate the data by type of disability because for some types of disability there should be equality of learning outcomes, whilst for others measuring learning outcomes is not an adequate measure of the quality of education

Levels of disaggregation: Gender, Income, Minority, Region, Urban/Rural, Persons with Disabilities, Persons with HIV/AIDS, Migrants, Refugees and IDPs, Persons in Detention, Public/Private, Child Labourers, Level of Education

Available data: For data on learning outcomes, as measured by international assessments, see *Edstats* (SEARCH: Series > Topics > Learning Outcomes):

<http://databank.worldbank.org/data/reports.aspx?source=Education%20Statistics>

Human rights standards: Article 13, International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Article 28, Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 17 (2), (Revised) European Social Charter; Article 13, Protocol of San Salvador; Article 11, African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child; Article 13, African Youth Charter; Article 41(2), Arab Charter; Article 4, UNESCO Convention against Discrimination in Education

Tags: Armed Conflict (Including Child Soldiers), Natural Disasters, Quality of Education, Learning Outcomes, Educational Freedom/Private Education, Primary, Secondary, Women and Girls, Indigenous Peoples and Minorities, Persons with Disabilities, Persons with HIV/AIDS, Migrants, Refugees and IDPs, Persons in Detention, Persons Living in Poverty, Child Labourers, Outcome Indicators

Mean performance on the science scale

Definition: Mean performance on the science scale is the mean science score for students in national or international assessments

Comments: A low mean performance on the science scale may be indicative of a general problem in the quality of education. The data for this indicator should be disaggregated to measure relative enjoyment across and between groups, for example boys compared to girls and those living in different regions of the country. Inequalities in enjoyment may constitute discrimination. For this indicator it is important, when monitoring the right to education of persons with disabilities, to disaggregate the data by type of disability because for some types of disability there should be equality of learning outcomes, whilst for others measuring learning outcomes is not an adequate measure of the quality of education

Levels of disaggregation: Gender, Income, Minority, Region, Urban/Rural, Persons with Disabilities, Persons with HIV/AIDS, Migrants, Refugees and IDPs, Persons in Detention, Public/Private, Child Labourers, Level of Education

Available data: For data on learning outcomes, as measured by international assessments, see *Edstats* (SEARCH: Series > Topics > Learning Outcomes):

<http://databank.worldbank.org/data/reports.aspx?source=Education%20Statistics>

Human rights standards: Article 13, International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Article 28, Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 17 (2), (Revised) European Social Charter; Article 13, Protocol of San Salvador; Article 11, African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child; Article 13, African Youth Charter; Article 41 (2), Arab Charter; Article 4, UNESCO Convention against Discrimination in Education

Tags: Armed Conflict (Including Child Soldiers), Natural Disasters, Quality of Education, Learning Outcomes, Educational Freedom/Private Education, Primary, Secondary, Women and Girls, Indigenous Peoples and Minorities, Persons with Disabilities, Persons with

HIV/AIDS, Migrants, Refugees and IDPs, Persons in Detention, Persons Living in Poverty, Child Labourers, Outcome Indicators

Percentage of students at the lowest level of reading proficiency

Definition: Percentage of students at the lowest level of reading proficiency is the percentage of students at the lowest level of proficiency on the reading scale in national or international assessments

Comments: A high value indicates that a significant proportion of children are not enjoying education of good quality. For this indicator it is important to disaggregate the data and look at which marginalised groups make up the percentage of students at the lowest level of reading proficiency. Care must be taken when interpreting data for persons with disabilities. You should look at the data disaggregated by type of disability and assess whether the test is an accurate measure of the quality of education for persons with that particular disability

Levels of disaggregation: Gender, Income, Minority, Region, Urban/Rural, Persons with Disabilities, Persons with HIV/AIDS, Migrants, Refugees and IDPs, Persons in Detention, Public/Private, Child Labourers, Level of Education

Available data: For data on learning outcomes, as measured by international assessments, see *Edstats* (SEARCH: Series > Topics > Learning Outcomes):

<http://databank.worldbank.org/data/reports.aspx?source=Education%20Statistics>

Human rights standards: Article 13, International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Article 28, Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 17 (2), (Revised) European Social Charter; Article 13, Protocol of San Salvador; Article 11, African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child; Article 13, African Youth Charter; Article 41(2), Arab Charter; Article 4, UNESCO Convention against Discrimination in Education

Tags: Armed Conflict (Including Child Soldiers), Natural Disasters, Quality of Education, Learning Outcomes, Educational Freedom/Private Education, Primary, Secondary, Women and Girls, Indigenous Peoples and Minorities, Persons with Disabilities, Persons with HIV/AIDS, Migrants, Refugees and IDPs, Persons in Detention, Persons Living in Poverty, Child Labourers, Outcome Indicators

Percentage of students at the lowest level of mathematics proficiency

Definition: Percentage of students at the lowest level of mathematics proficiency is the percentage of students at the lowest level of proficiency on the mathematics scale in national or international assessments

Comments: A high percentage of students at the lowest level of mathematics proficiency reflects that a significant proportion of children are not enjoying education of good quality. For this indicator it is important to disaggregate the data and look at which marginalised groups make up the percentage of students at the lowest level of mathematics proficiency. Care must be taken when interpreting data for persons with disabilities. You should look at

the data disaggregated by type of disability and assess whether the test is an accurate measure of the quality of education for persons with that particular disability

Levels of disaggregation: Gender, Income, Minority, Region, Urban/Rural, Persons with Disabilities, Persons with HIV/AIDS, Migrants, Refugees and IDPs, Persons in Detention, Public/Private, Child Labourers, Level of Education

Available data: For data on learning outcomes, as measured by international assessments, see *Edstats* (SEARCH: Series > Topics > Learning Outcomes):

<http://databank.worldbank.org/data/reports.aspx?source=Education%20Statistics>

Human rights standards: Article 13, International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Article 28, Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 17 (2), (Revised) European Social Charter; Article 13, Protocol of San Salvador; Article 11, African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child; Article 13, African Youth Charter; Article 41 (2), Arab Charter; Article 4, UNESCO Convention against Discrimination in Education

Tags: Armed Conflict (Including Child Soldiers), Natural Disasters, Quality of Education, Learning Outcomes, Educational Freedom/Private Education, Primary, Secondary, Women and Girls, Indigenous Peoples and Minorities, Persons with Disabilities, Persons with HIV/AIDS, Migrants, Refugees and IDPs, Persons in Detention, Persons Living in Poverty, Child Labourers, Outcome Indicators

Percentage of students at the lowest level of science proficiency

Definition: Percentage of students at the lowest level of science proficiency is the percentage of students at the lowest level of proficiency on the science scale in national or international assessments

Comments: A high percentage of students at the lowest level of science proficiency reflects that a significant proportion of children are not enjoying education of good quality. For this indicator it is important to disaggregate the data and look at which marginalised groups make up the percentage of students at the lowest level of science proficiency. Care must be taken when interpreting data for persons with disabilities. You should look at the data disaggregated by type of disability and assess whether the test is an accurate measure of the quality of education for persons with that particular disability

Levels of disaggregation: Gender, Income, Minority, Region, Urban/Rural, Persons with Disabilities, Persons with HIV/AIDS, Migrants, Refugees and IDPs, Persons in Detention, Public/Private, Child Labourers, Level of Education

Available data: For data on learning outcomes, as measured by international assessments, see *Edstats* (SEARCH: Series > Topics > Learning Outcomes):

<http://databank.worldbank.org/data/reports.aspx?source=Education%20Statistics>

Human rights standards: Article 13, International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Article 28, Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 17 (2), (Revised) European Social Charter; Article 13, Protocol of San Salvador; Article 11, African Charter on the Rights

and Welfare of the Child; Article 13, African Youth Charter; Article 41 (2), Arab Charter; Article 4, UNESCO Convention against Discrimination in Education

Tags: Armed Conflict (Including Child Soldiers), Natural Disasters, Quality of Education, Learning Outcomes, Educational Freedom/Private Education, Primary, Secondary, Women and Girls, Indigenous Peoples and Minorities, Persons with Disabilities, Persons with HIV/AIDS, Migrants, Refugees and IDPs, Persons in Detention, Persons Living in Poverty, Child Labourers, Outcome Indicators

Repetition rate

Definition: Repetition rate is the proportion of pupils from a cohort enrolled in a given grade at a given school year of primary or secondary education who study in the same grade in the following school year (Source: UIS)

Comments: A high repetition rate can be symptomatic of problems in the education system that affect the right to education, related to a variety of issues, such as the poor quality of instruction, the relevance and quality of the content of education, its cultural appropriateness, the safety of the school and the extent to which the education is adapted locally to suit specific contexts. The data for this indicator should be disaggregated to measure relative enjoyment across and between groups, for example boys compared to girls and those living in different regions of the country. Inequalities in enjoyment may constitute discrimination

Levels of disaggregation: Level of Education, Gender, Income, Minority, Region, Urban/Rural, Persons with Disabilities, Persons with HIV/AIDS, Migrants, Refugees and IDPs, Persons in Detention, Public/Private, Child Labourers

Available data: For data on repetition rates at the primary level, see *Edstats*: <http://databank.worldbank.org/data/reports.aspx?source=Education%20Statistics>

Human rights standards: Article 13, International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Article, 28 Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 17 (2), (Revised) European Social Charter; Article 13, Protocol of San Salvador; Article 11, African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child; Article 13, African Youth Charter; Article 41 (2), Arab Charter; Article 4, UNESCO Convention against Discrimination in Education

Tags: Armed Conflict (Including Child Soldiers), Natural Disasters, Quality of Education, Educational Freedom/Private Education, Primary, Secondary, Women and Girls, Indigenous Peoples and Minorities, Persons with Disabilities, Persons with HIV/AIDS, Migrants, Refugees and IDPs, Persons in Detention, Persons Living in Poverty, Child Labourers, Outcome Indicators

Percentage of private enrolment

Definition: Private enrolment refers to pupils or students enrolled at a given level of education in institutions that are not operated by a public authority but controlled and

managed, whether for profit or not, by a private body, such as a non-governmental organisation, religious body, special interest group, foundation or business enterprise

Comments: A high level of this indicator may be indicative of a poor quality of education in public schools, which typically has a particularly detrimental effect on poor children, whose families often cannot afford to pay private school fees. Furthermore, an increasing percentage over time of private enrolment at a given educational level could be indicative of worsening quality of education in public schools. The data for this indicator should be disaggregated to measure enrolment across and between groups, particularly boys compared to girls and persons with disabilities compared to the general population. This is important because a high differential in enrolment rates between and across groups may be indicative of discrimination in access to private education for certain groups. You should also collect disaggregated data by income as this can tell you about the socio-economic background of the students that the school targets

Levels of disaggregation: Level of Education, Gender, Income, Minority, Region, Urban/Rural, Persons with Disabilities, Migrants, Refugees and IDPs

Available data: UIS has data for enrolment rates in private institutions for all levels of education (Education>Participation>Enrolment>Enrolment by type of institution): <http://data.uis.unesco.org/Index.aspx?queryid=120>

Human rights standards: Article 13 (4), International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Article 29 (2), Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 13 (5), Protocol of San Salvador; Article 11 (7), African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child; Article 14 (3), European Union Charter of Fundamental Rights; Article 2, Op Protocol 1, European Convention on Human Rights; Article 17 (1) (a), (Revised) European Social Charter; Article 13, Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities; Article 27 (3), ILO Convention 169

Tags: Access to Education, Free Education, Educational Freedom/Private Education, Pre-Primary, Primary, Secondary, Women and Girls, Indigenous Peoples and Minorities, Persons with Disabilities, Migrants, Refugees and IDPs, Persons Living in Poverty, Outcome Indicators

Are measures taken to enhance parents' understanding of the importance of their children's early education?

Definition: Such measures include publicity campaigns and workshops

Comments: Lack of concrete measures to enhance parents' understanding of the importance of their children's early education may reduce the likelihood that parents will send their children to pre-primary schools

Levels of disaggregation:

Available data:

Human rights standards: Article 13 (2) (a), International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Article 28 (1) (a) (e), Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 24 (2), Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities; Article 7 (2) (c), ILO Convention 182; Article 17 (2), (Revised) European Social Charter; Article 13 (3) (a) (d), Protocol of San Salvador; Article 11 (3) (a) (d), African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child, Article 13 (4) (a) (c), African Youth Charter; Article 41 (2), Arab Charter; Article 4 (a), UNESCO Convention against Discrimination in Education. The following provisions mention pre-primary specifically: Article 10 (a), Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women; Article 30, Convention on the Protection of All Migrant Workers and Members of their Families; Article 13, Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities

Tags: Pre-Primary, Participation, Process Indicators

Percentage of schools with buildings in a state of disrepair

Definition: The percentage of schools where buildings used by students or teachers are damaged and thus pose a safety risk. Indications that a school building is in a state of disrepair include: a leaky or collapsing roof, broken windows, buckling floors and broken toilets (Source: Audrey Chapman (2007) *Development of Indicators for Economic, Social and Cultural Rights: The Rights to Education, Participation in Cultural Life and Access to the Benefits of Science*: p.145)

Comments: A high percentage of schools with buildings in a state of disrepair indicates that the learning environment is unsuitable and unsafe for learners, and is therefore incongruent with the right to a quality education. It is important to disaggregate the data for this indicator, particularly across regions, urban compared to rural schools and public compared to private schools. This may reveal unequal enjoyment of quality education, which may be indicative of discrimination

Levels of disaggregation: Level of Education, Urban/Rural, Region, Public/Private

Available data:

Human rights standards: Article 13 (3), International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Article 10 (b), Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women; Article 29, Convention on the Rights of the Child (CRC General Comment 1, paras 8 & 12)

Tags: Armed Conflict (Including Child Soldiers), Quality of Education, School Infrastructure, School Safety and Violence, Educational Freedom/Private Education, Pre-Primary, Primary, Secondary, Vocational Education, Higher Education, Process Indicators

Percentage of schools that have a shortage of classrooms

Definition: The percentage of schools where there are not enough safe classrooms for instruction to take place (Source: Audrey Chapman (2007) *Development of Indicators for*

Economic, Social and Cultural Rights: The Rights to Education, Participation in Cultural Life and Access to the Benefits of Science: p.145)

Comments: A high percentage of schools that have a shortage of classrooms reflects a problem in the availability of education. It is important to disaggregate the data for this indicator, particularly across regions, urban compared to rural schools and public compared to private schools. This may reveal unequal enjoyment of quality education, which may be indicative of discrimination

Levels of disaggregation: Level of Education, Urban/Rural, Region, Public/Private

Available data:

Human rights standards: Article 13, International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Article 28, Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 17 (2), (Revised) European Social Charter; Article 13, Protocol of San Salvador; Article 11, African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child; Article 13, African Youth Charter; Article 41 (2), Arab Charter; Article 4, UNESCO Convention against Discrimination in Education

Tags: Armed Conflict (Including Child Soldiers), Quality of Education, School Infrastructure, Educational Freedom/Private Education, Pre-Primary, Primary, Secondary, Vocational Education, Higher Education, Process Indicators

Percentage of schools with potable water

Definition: Percentage of schools with potable water is the share of schools at a given level of education with a drinking water facility or water delivery point that is designed to protect water from external contamination, particularly of fecal origin. Examples of potable drinking water facilities include: pipe-borne water, protected wells, boreholes, protected spring water and rainwater

Comments: Access to potable water is important for ensuring hygienic practices within schools and reducing the spread of certain diseases which may affect pupils' well-being or educational performance. It is important to disaggregate the data for this indicator, particularly across regions, urban compared to rural schools and public compared to private schools. This may reveal unequal enjoyment of quality education, which may be indicative of discrimination

Levels of disaggregation: Level of Education, Urban/Rural, Region, Public/Private

Available data: For public primary and lower secondary schools in African countries, see *EdStats* (Africa Dataset): <http://databank.worldbank.org/data/reports.aspx?source=Education%20Statistics>

Human rights standards: Articles 11, 12 & 13 (2), International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Paras 12 (c) (i) & 16 (b) of CESCR General Comment 15; Article 28 (1), Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 17 (2), (Revised) European Social Charter; Article 13 (3), Protocol of San Salvador; Articles 11 (3) & 14 (2) (c), African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child

Tags: Armed Conflict (Including Child Soldiers), Quality of Education, School Infrastructure, Educational Freedom/Private Education, Pre-Primary, Primary, Secondary, Vocational Education, Higher Education, Process Indicators

Percentage of schools without toilets

Definition: Percentage of schools without toilets is the share of schools at a given level of education without a pit latrine, an improved pit latrine, a flush toilet, a pour-flush toilet or a composting toilet

Comments: Access to toilets is important for ensuring hygienic practices within schools and reducing the spread of certain diseases which may affect pupils' well-being or educational performance. It is important to disaggregate the data for this indicator, particularly across regions, urban compared to rural schools and public compared to private schools. This may reveal unequal enjoyment of quality education, which may be indicative of discrimination

Levels of disaggregation: Level of Education, Urban/Rural, Region, Public/Private

Available data: For public primary and lower secondary schools in African countries, see *EdStats* (Africa Dataset): <http://databank.worldbank.org/data/reports.aspx?source=Education%20Statistics>

Human rights standards: Article 11, 12 & 13 (2), International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Para 6 (a), CESCR General Comment 13; 12 (c) (i) & 16 (b) of CESCR General Comment 15; Article 28 (1), Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 17 (2), (Revised) European Social Charter; Article 13 (3), Protocol of San Salvador; Article 11 (3), African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child

Tags: Armed Conflict (Including Child Soldiers), Quality of Education, School Infrastructure, Educational Freedom/Private Education, Pre-Primary, Primary, Secondary, Vocational Education, Higher Education, Process Indicators

Percentage of schools without single-sex toilets

Definition: Percentage of schools without single-sex toilets is the share of schools without separate girls and boys toilets or single-sex educational institutions without toilets. Schools are counted as having toilets if they have a pit latrine, an improved pit latrine, a flush toilet, a pour-flush toilet or a composting toilet

Comments: Lack of single-sex toilets in schools may deter parents from sending girls to school, particularly in traditional societies. It may also deter girls themselves from attending school or even cause them to drop-out. It is important to disaggregate the data for this indicator, particularly across regions, urban compared to rural schools and public compared to private schools. This may reveal unequal enjoyment of quality education, which may be indicative of discrimination

Levels of disaggregation: Level of Education, Urban/Rural, Region, Public/Private

Available data: For public primary and lower secondary schools in African countries, see *EdStats*: <http://databank.worldbank.org/data/reports.aspx?source=Education%20Statistics>

Human rights standards: Articles 11, 12 & 13 (2), International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; 12 (c) (i) & 16 (b), CESCR General Comment 15; Para 6 (a), CESCR General Comment 13; Article 28 (1), Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 17 (2), (Revised) European Social Charter; Article 13 (3), Protocol of San Salvador; Article 11 (3), African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child; Article 10 (b), Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women

Tags: Quality of Education, School Infrastructure, School Safety and Violence, Educational Freedom/Private Education, Primary, Secondary, Vocational Education, Higher Education, Women and Girls, Process Indicators

Percentage of schools without electricity

Definition: Percentage of schools without electricity is the share of schools with no access to permanent sources of electrical power, for example grid / mains connection, wind, water, solar, permanently fuel-powered generator, etc.

Comments: Lack of electricity may undermine the use of various learning materials, such as computers, slide projectors, etc. It is important to disaggregate the data for this indicator, particularly across regions, urban compared to rural schools and public compared to private schools. This may reveal unequal enjoyment of quality education, which may be indicative of discrimination

Levels of disaggregation: Level of Education, Urban/Rural, Region, Public/Private

Available data: For public primary and lower secondary schools in African countries, see *EdStats* (Africa Dataset): <http://databank.worldbank.org/data/reports.aspx?source=Education%20Statistics>

Human rights standards: Article 13, International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Article 28, Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 17 (2), (Revised) European Social Charter; Article 13, Protocol of San Salvador; Article 11, African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child; Article 13, African Youth Charter; Article 41 (2), Arab Charter; Article 4, UNESCO Convention against Discrimination in Education

Tags: Armed Conflict (Including Child Soldiers), Quality of Education, School Infrastructure, School Safety and Violence, Educational Freedom/Private Education, Pre-Primary, Primary, Secondary, Vocational Education, Higher Education, Process Indicators

Percentage of schools without access to a library

Definition: Percentage of schools without a library is the share of schools without access to a library, either on school premises, a public library, the library of a nearby school or a mobile library

Comments: Lack of access to a library may limit the access of children to books and other learning materials. It is important to disaggregate the data for this indicator, particularly across regions, urban compared to rural schools and public compared to private schools. This may reveal unequal enjoyment of quality education, which may be indicative of discrimination

Levels of disaggregation: Level of Education, Urban/Rural, Region, Public/Private

Available data:

Human rights standards: Article 13, International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Para 6 (a), CESCR General Comment 13; Article 28, Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 17 (2), (Revised) European Social Charter; Article 13, Protocol of San Salvador; Article 11, African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child; Article 13, African Youth Charter; Article 41 (2), Arab Charter; Article 4, UNESCO Convention against Discrimination in Education

Tags: Quality of Education, Learning Material, School Infrastructure, Primary, Secondary, Vocational Education, Higher Education, Process Indicators

Percentage of schools without computer facilities

Definition: Percentage of schools without computer facilities is the share of schools without computer facilities

Comments: Lack of computer facilities may diminish learners' opportunities to receive an education of good quality, as well as learn skills that enhance future employability. It is important to disaggregate the data for this indicator, particularly across regions, urban compared to rural schools and public compared to private schools. This may reveal unequal enjoyment of quality education, which may be indicative of discrimination

Levels of disaggregation: Level of Education, Urban/Rural, Region, Public/Private

Available data:

Human rights standards: Article 13 (2), International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Para 6 (a), CESCR General Comment 13; Articles 28 (1) & (3), Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 17 (2), (Revised) European Social Charter; Article 13, Protocol of San Salvador; Article 11, African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child; Article 13 (4) (j), African Youth Charter; Article 41 (2), Arab Charter; Article 4, UNESCO Convention against Discrimination in Education

Tags: Quality of Education, Learning Material, School Infrastructure, Primary, Secondary, Vocational Education, Higher Education, Process Indicators

Percentage of schools without fire exits

Definition: Percentage of schools without fire exits is the share of schools without a fire exit

Comments: A high percentage of schools without fire exits reflects a problem in schools' safety. It is important to disaggregate the data for this indicator, particularly across regions, urban compared to rural schools and public compared to private schools. This may reveal unequal enjoyment of quality education, which may be indicative of discrimination

Levels of disaggregation: Level of Education, Urban/Rural, Region, Public/Private

Available data:

Human rights standards: Article 13 (2) (e), International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights

Tags: Quality of Education, School Infrastructure, School Safety and Violence, Pre-Primary, Primary, Secondary, Vocational Education, Higher Education, Process Indicators

Percentage of schools without first-aid kits

Definition: Percentage of schools without first-aid kits is the share of schools without first-aid kits

Comments: A high percentage of schools without first-aid kits reflects an inability to address the health concerns of all those in school, including students, teachers and administrative staff. It is important to disaggregate the data for this indicator, particularly across regions, urban compared to rural schools and public compared to private schools. This may reveal unequal enjoyment of quality education, which may be indicative of discrimination

Levels of disaggregation: Level of Education, Urban/Rural, Region, Public/Private

Available data:

Human rights standards: Articles 13 (2) & 12, International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Articles 19 (1) & 28 (1) (2), Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 17 (2), (Revised) European Social Charter; Article 13, Protocol of San Salvador; Article 11, African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child; Article 13, African Youth Charter; Article 41 (2), Arab Charter; Article 4, UNESCO Convention against Discrimination in Education

Tags: Quality of Education, School Infrastructure, School Safety and Violence, Pre-Primary, Primary, Secondary, Vocational Education, Higher Education, Process Indicators

Pupil/teacher ratio

Definition: Pupil / teacher ratio is the number of pupils enrolled at a given level of education divided by the number of teachers at that level (regardless of teaching assignment)

Comments: A high pupil / teacher ratio reflects a shortage of available teachers and may affect the quality of education received. It is important to disaggregate the data for this indicator, particularly across regions, urban compared to rural schools and public compared

to private schools. This may reveal unequal enjoyment of quality education, which may be indicative of discrimination

Levels of disaggregation: Level of Education, Urban/Rural, Region, Public/Private

Available data: UIS (Education>Human Resources>Pupil-Teacher Ratio):

<http://data.uis.unesco.org/Index.aspx?queryid=120>

Human rights standards: Article 13, International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Article 28, Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 17 (2), (Revised) European Social Charter; Article 13, Protocol of San Salvador; Article 11, African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child; Article 13, African Youth Charter; Article 41 (2), Arab Charter; Article 4, UNESCO Convention against Discrimination in Education

Tags: Quality of Education, Teachers, Educational Freedom/Private Education, Pre-Primary, Primary, Secondary, Vocational Education, Process Indicators

Are there transparent procedures for the hiring process of teachers and for contracts/tenders for education services?

Definition: Transparent procedures include, *inter alia*, publicly available information about the requirements needed to apply for a teaching position for each level of education and the process for selecting the candidates

Comments: Transparent and fair hiring procedures are essential to ensure that the best possible candidates are selected (which affects the quality of education), to prevent discriminatory practices in the hiring of teachers and to prevent corruption in the education system

Levels of disaggregation: Level of Education, Public/Private, Region

Available data:

Human rights standards:

Tags: Quality of Education, Teachers, Educational Freedom/Private Education, Pre-Primary, Primary, Secondary, Vocational Education, Higher Education, Transparency, Process Indicators

Number of years of education required for teachers to meet certification requirements

Definition: This indicator measures the number of years of education required for school teachers to meet certification requirements to teach at a given level of education (Source: Audrey Chapman (2007) *Development of Indicators for Economic, Social and Cultural Rights: The Rights to Education, Participation in Cultural Life and Access to the Benefits of Science:* p.148)

Comments: A low number of years of education required for teachers to meet certification requirements (especially compared with other countries) may be indicative of inadequate training for teachers, therefore potentially affecting the quality of education delivered

Levels of disaggregation: Level of Education, Public/Private, Region

Available data:

Human rights standards: Article 13, International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Article 28, Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 17 (2), (Revised) European Social Charter; Article 13, Protocol of San Salvador; Article 11, African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child; Article 13, African Youth Charter; Article 41 (2), Arab Charter; Article 4, UNESCO Convention against Discrimination in Education

Tags: Quality of Education, Teachers, Educational Freedom/Private Education, Pre-Primary, Primary, Secondary, Vocational Education, Process Indicators

Number of years of higher education required for qualified teachers

Definition: Number of required years of education for qualified teachers is the number of years of higher education required in a country to be a teacher at a given level of education

Comments: A relatively low number of years (when compared with other countries) may be indicative of inadequate efforts by the State to ensure a good quality of education

Levels of disaggregation: Level of Education, Public/Private, Region

Available data:

Human rights standards: Article 13, International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Article 28, Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 17 (2), (Revised) European Social Charter; Article 13, Protocol of San Salvador; Article 11, African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child; Article 13, African Youth Charter; Article 41 (2), Arab Charter; Article 4, UNESCO Convention against Discrimination in Education

Tags: Quality of Education, Teachers, Educational Freedom/Private Education, Pre-Primary, Primary, Secondary, Vocational Education, Process Indicators

Percentage of trained teachers

Definition: Total number of teachers who have received the minimum organised teacher-training (pre-service or in-service) required for teaching at the relevant level of education in a given country, expressed as a percentage of the total number of teachers at the same level of education (Source: UIS)

Comments: A low value for this indicator may be indicative that children are being taught by teachers who are not adequately trained, who may not have an adequate knowledge of the subject matter they teach, who do not have the necessary pedagogical skills to teach and

may not use the available instructional materials in an effective manner. This would suggest a problem in the acceptability of the education system and the quality of education

Levels of disaggregation: Level of Education, Urban/Rural, Public/Private, Region

Available data: *UIS* (Education>Human resources>Percentage of Teachers>Percentage of Trained Teachers by Level of Education):

http://data.uis.unesco.org/Index.aspx?DataSetCode=EDULIT_DS&popupcustomise=true&lang=en

Human rights standards: Article 13, International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Article 28, Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 17 (2), (Revised) European Social Charter; Article 13, Protocol of San Salvador; Article 11, African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child; Article 13, African Youth Charter; Article 41 (2), Arab Charter; Article 4, UNESCO Convention against Discrimination in Education

Tags: Quality of Education, Teachers, Pre-Primary, Primary, Secondary, Vocational Education, Process Indicators

Percentage of teachers with social security benefits

Definition: Social security benefits covers all measures that provide benefits, whether in cash or in kind, to secure protection, from (a) lack of work-related income (or insufficient income) caused by sickness, disability, maternity, employment injury, unemployment, old age, or death of a family member; (b) lack of access or unaffordable access to health care; (c) insufficient family support, particularly for children and adult dependants; and (d) general poverty and social exclusion (Source: ILO)

Comments: A low percentage of teachers with social security benefits is indicative of a violation of teachers' right to social security which may affect their motivation to provide quality education

Levels of disaggregation: Public/Private

Available data:

Human rights standards: Articles 9 & 13 (2) (e), International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Article 12, (Revised) European Social Charter; Section XI, Recommendation concerning the Status of Teachers

Tags: Teachers, Process Indicators

Teachers' union density rate

Definition: Teachers' union density rate is the number of teachers who are members of a teachers' union as a percentage of the total number of teachers. A teachers' union is defined as a teachers' organisation constituted for the purpose of furthering and defending the interests of teachers

Comments: A very low teachers' union density rate may be indicative of restrictions (in law or in practice) set by the government to prevent teachers becoming members of trade unions, thus infringing their right to freedom of assembly

Levels of disaggregation: Public/Private

Available data:

Human rights standards: Article 22, International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights; Article 8 & 13 (2) (e), International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Article 11, European Convention on Human Rights; Article 5 (e) (ii), International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination; Articles 10 & 11, African [Banjul] Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights; Article 16, American Convention on Human Rights; Article 8, Protocol of San Salvador; Articles 28 & 12, European Union Charter of Fundamental Rights; Articles 5 & 6, (Revised) European Social Charter; ILO Declaration on Fundamental Principles and Rights at Work; ILO Conventions 87 & 98; Article 35, Arab Charter

Tags: Teachers, Process Indicators

Teachers' salary rate

Definition: The proportion between the average teacher's salary and other jobs in the public sector that require a similar level of education

Comments: A low teachers' salary rate may indicate that teachers do not receive competitive salaries, which may deter the most competent persons from becoming teachers

Levels of disaggregation: Level of Education, Gender, Public/Private, Urban/Rural, Region

Available data: *EdStats* provides information on annual statutory teacher starting salaries in public pre-primary, primary, lower secondary and upper secondary schools: <http://databank.worldbank.org/data/reports.aspx?source=education-statistics-~all-indicators>

Human rights standards: Article 13 (2) (e), International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights

Tags: Quality of Education, Teachers, Process Indicators

Do teachers enjoy academic freedom?

Definition: Academic freedom is the liberty of members of the academic community, individually or collectively, to pursue, develop and transmit knowledge and ideas, through research, teaching, study, discussion, documentation, production, creation and / or writing

Comments: Academic freedom is the freedom indispensable for scientific and academic research (see General Comment 13, paras 38-40) and is closely linked to the right to freedom of speech and expression. Without academic freedom the right to education cannot be enjoyed

Levels of disaggregation: Region, Public/Private

Available data:

Human rights standards: Articles 15 (3) & 13, International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Paras 38-40, CESCR General Comment 13; Article 19, International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights; Article 13, European Union Charter of Fundamental Rights; Article 10, European Convention on Human Rights; Article 42 (2), Arab Charter

Tags: Quality of Education, Content of Education, Teachers, Higher Education, Process Indicators

Number of reported incidents of repression against teachers for their political, ideological or religious beliefs or teachers' union activity

Definition: Examples of incidents of repression include teachers / professors who have criticised governments and have subsequently been removed from office, imprisoned, reported missing, reported killed, etc.

Comments: Teachers must be free to enjoy their rights to freedom of assembly and association; thought, conscience and religion; expression; as well as the right to a fair trial; liberty and security; and life, amongst others. Incidents of repression are violations of these rights and also the right to education

Levels of disaggregation: Region, Public/Private

Available data:

Human rights standards: Articles 6 (1), 7 & 9, International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights; Articles 2, 3 & 5, European Convention on Human Rights; Articles 4-6, African [Banjul] Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights; Articles 5, 8 & 14, Arab Charter; Articles 4, 5 & 7, American Convention on Human Rights

Tags: Quality of Education, Teachers, Higher Education, Process Indicators

Percentage of the population for whom school-house distance is more than 5 km

Definition: The percentage of students for whom the actual (rather than straight line) distance they are required to travel in order to get to school from their house exceeds 5km

Comments: A high percentage of the population for whom school is farther than 5km may be indicative of problems in the availability and physical accessibility of schools

Levels of disaggregation: Level of Education, Region, Urban/Rural, Public/Private

Available data:

Human rights standards: Article 13 (2), International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Article 28 (1), Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 17 (2), (Revised)

European Social Charter; Article 13 (3), Protocol of San Salvador; Article 11 (3), African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child

Tags: Access to Education, Physical Accessibility, School Safety and Violence, Pre-Primary, Primary, Secondary, Process Indicators

Percentage of household expenditure on education

Definition: Percentage of household expenditure on education is the total average cost per month per family for a student in a school as a percentage of total household expenditure. Examples of educational expenses include: enrolment fees, tuition fees, uniforms, school supplies and educational materials, school meals and school transport and other payments necessary to effectively access education, such as payment for water, security etc.

Comments: A high percentage of household expenditure on education may reflect a problem in the economic accessibility of public schools. It may also constitute a violation of the right to free education

Levels of disaggregation: Level of Education, Gender, Income, Region, Urban/Rural, Public/Private, Persons with Disabilities

Available data:

Human rights standards: Articles 23 (3) & 24(2), Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities; Article 13 (2), International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Article 28 (1), Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 17 (2), (Revised) European Social Charter; Article 13 (3), Protocol of San Salvador; Article 11 (3), African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child; Article 13 (4) (a) (b), African Youth Charter; Article 41 (2), Arab Charter; Article 31 (2), Asean Human Rights Declaration; Article 14 (2), European Union Charter of Fundamental Rights

Tags: Access to Education, Economic Accessibility, Free Education, Educational Freedom/Private Education, Pre-Primary, Primary, Secondary, Vocational Education, Higher Education, Women and Girls, Persons with Disabilities, Persons Living in Poverty, Process Indicators

Is there a special funding system to ensure access to education for students from marginalised groups?

Definition: Marginalised groups are all those excluded from governmental policy and access to education including: women and girls, indigenous peoples and minorities, persons with disabilities, persons with HIV / AIDS, child labourers, persons in detention, migrants, refugees and IDPs, and persons living in poverty (Source: Audrey Chapman (2007) *Development of Indicators for Economic, Social and Cultural Rights: The Rights to Education, Participation in Cultural Life and Access to the Benefits of Science*: p.145)

Comments: Special funding systems (eg cash transfers) are often necessary to ensure full access to education for students from marginalised groups

Levels of disaggregation: Level of Education, Gender, Minority, Region, Urban/Rural, Persons with HIV/AIDS, Migrants, Refugees and IDPs, Persons Living in Poverty, Persons with Disabilities, Child Labourers, Child Soldiers

Available data:

Human rights standards: Articles 13 (2) (b) & (e), International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Article 28 (1) (b), Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 10 (d), Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women; Article 11 (3) (e), African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child; Article 12 (1) (a), Protocol to the African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights of Women; Article 10 (4) (b), (Revised) European Social Charter; Article 14 (4) (l), African Youth Charter

Tags: Armed Conflict (Including Child Soldiers), Access to Education, Economic Accessibility, Free Education, Women and Girls, Indigenous Peoples and Minorities, Persons with Disabilities, Persons with HIV/AIDS, Migrants, Refugees and IDPs, Persons Living in Poverty, Child Labourers, Process Indicators

Pupil/textbook ratio

Definition: Pupil / textbook ratio is the average number of pupils for every textbook in schools

Comments: Textbooks are one of the major teaching and learning resources used in schools. Given that a large number low income families cannot afford to buy their own textbooks, this is an important indicator related to equal access to quality education

Levels of disaggregation: Level of Education, Region, Urban/Rural

Available data: For the number of pupils per textbook (mathematics and reading only) in public primary schools in African countries, see *EdStats* (Africa Dataset): <http://databank.worldbank.org/data/reports.aspx?source=Education%20Statistics>

Human rights standards: Article 13 (2) (a), International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Article 28 (1) (a), Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 17 (2), (Revised) European Social Charter; Article 13 (3) (a), Protocol of San Salvador; Article 11 (3) (a), African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child

Tags: Quality of Education, Learning Material, Primary, Secondary, Vocational Education, Process Indicators

Do children have to present a birth certificate to enrol in school?

Definition: The requirement to present a birth certificate in order to enrol in school may be prescribed by local, regional or national law

Comments: Such a requirement impairs access to education of children without birth certificates and may amount to discrimination

Levels of disaggregation:**Available data:**

Human rights standards: Article 30, Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families; Article 22, Convention relating to the Status of Refugees; Articles 2 (2) (3) & 13 (2), International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Para 34, CESCR General Comment 13; Article 2, Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 3 (e), UNESCO Convention against Discrimination in Education

Tags: Access to Education, Administrative Accessibility, Pre-Primary, Primary, Secondary, Vocational Education, Indigenous Peoples and Minorities, Migrants, Refugees and IDPs, Persons Living in Poverty, Structural Indicators

Can children of seasonal migrants enrol in schools?

Definition: Seasonal migrants are persons employed in a State other than their own for part of the year because the work they perform depends on seasonal conditions

Comments: Not allowing children of seasonal migrants to enrol in school prevents full access to education for such children

Levels of disaggregation: Level of Education

Available data:

Human rights standards: Article 30, Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families; Article 22, Convention relating to the Status of Refugees; Article 28 (1), Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 3 (e), UNESCO Convention against Discrimination in Education; Articles 2 (2) (3) & 13 (2), International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Para 34, CESCR General Comment 13

Tags: Access to Education, Administrative Accessibility, Pre-Primary, Primary, Secondary, Vocational Education, Migrants, Refugees and IDPs, Process Indicators

Is the State taking steps to identify out-of-school children, to encourage school attendance and to reduce drop-out rates?

Definition: Out-of-school children are all those excluded from education at a given level of education

Comments: Check whether there are specific programmes for this purpose, whether they respond to a thorough diagnostic of the specific reasons in the country amongst specific groups for drop-outs and out-of school children; and whether these programmes are well-funded. If disaggregated data on numbers of out-of-school children shows that children from specific marginalised groups are disproportionately represented, check whether the State

has adopted specific measures to encourage school attendance amongst children from those groups

Levels of disaggregation:

Available data: *Global Initiative on Out-of-School Children:*

<http://www.uis.unesco.org/LAYOUTS/UNESCO/oosci-data-tool/index-en.html#en/cover>

Human rights standards: Article 13 (2), International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Article 28 (1) (a) (e), Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 24 (2), Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities; Article 7 (2) (c) (d), ILO Convention 182; Article 17 (2), (Revised) European Social Charter; Article 13 (3) (a) (d), Protocol of San Salvador; Articles 11 (3) (a) (d) (e) & 6, African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child; Articles 13 (4) (c) (h), African Youth Charter; Article 41 (2), Arab Charter; Article 10 (f), Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women

Tags: Armed Conflict (Including Child Soldiers), Access to Education, Free Education, Women and Girls, Indigenous Peoples and Minorities, Persons with Disabilities, Persons with HIV/AIDS, Migrants, Refugees and IDPs, Persons in Detention, Persons Living in Poverty, Child Labourers, Process Indicators

Are there established mechanisms to enable parents, children and community leaders to contribute to the formulation and/or implementation of strategies to identify out-of-school children, to encourage school attendance and to reduce drop-out rates?

Definition:

Comments: Established mechanisms that enable parents, children and / or community leaders to contribute to defining school curricula can help make education relevant, culturally appropriate and adaptable to suit specific contexts - all essential elements of the right to education

Levels of disaggregation:

Available data:

Human rights standards: Article 13, International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Article 28, Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 17 (2), (Revised) European Social Charter; Article 13, Protocol of San Salvador; Article 11, African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child; Article 13, African Youth Charter; Article 41 (2), Arab Charter; Article 4, UNESCO Convention against Discrimination in Education

Tags: Quality of Education, Content of Education, Participation, Process Indicators

Are there any specific measures to ensure that previously out-of-school children remain in school?

Definition: An example of such a measure is a programme that adapts education to students' specific circumstances to prevent further drop-outs

Comments: Previously out-of-school children may require additional support given that they have already missed schooling and are, as a result, more likely to drop-out of school again

Levels of disaggregation:

Available data:

Human rights standards: Article 13 (2), International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Article 28 (1), Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 17 (2), (Revised) European Social Charter; Article 13 (3), Protocol of San Salvador; Article 11 (3), African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child

Tags: Armed Conflict (Including Child Soldiers), Access to Education, Free Education, Women and Girls, Indigenous Peoples and Minorities, Persons with Disabilities, Persons with HIV/AIDS, Migrants, Refugees and IDPs, Persons in Detention, Persons Living in Poverty, Child Labourers, Process Indicators

Are there minimum educational standards applicable to non-government schools?

Definition: According to international human rights law, non-government schools must conform to minimum educational standards, as laid down or approved by the State. Minimum educational standards may relate to issues such as admission, curricula and the recognition of certificates

Comments: The State has an obligation to ensure that minimum educational standards are met in schools not established by the public authorities, in order to ensure a decent quality of education for all

Levels of disaggregation:

Available data:

Human rights standards: Articles 13 (3) & (4), International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Article 29 (2), Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 11 (7), African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child; Article 2, Op Protocol 1, European Convention on Human Rights; Article 17 (1) (a), (Revised) European Social Charter; Article 27 (3), ILO Convention 169; Articles 4 (b) & 5 (b), UNESCO Convention against Discrimination in Education

Tags: Quality of Education, Educational Freedom/Private Education, Accountability, Process Indicators

Is there a monitoring body controlling whether minimum educational standards are met in private schools?

Definition: According to international human rights law, non-government schools must conform to minimum education standards, as laid down or approved by the State. In order to ensure that this is the case, there must be a body to oversee whether these standards are met

Comments: The State is responsible for ensuring minimum education standards are met in non-government schools and as such must establish a monitoring body to oversee whether these standards are met

Levels of disaggregation:

Available data:

Human rights standards: Articles 13 (3) & (4), International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Article 29 (2), Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 11 (7), African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child; Article 2, Op Protocol 1, European Convention on Human Rights; Article 17 (1) (a), (Revised) European Social Charter; Article 27 (3) ILO 169 ; Articles 4 (b) & 5 (b), UNESCO Convention against Discrimination in Education

Tags: Quality of Education, Educational Freedom/Private Education, Accountability, Process Indicators

Are there any established mechanisms that enable parents, children and/or community leaders to contribute to defining school curricula?

Definition:

Comments: Established mechanisms that enable parents, children and / or community leaders to contribute to defining school curricula can help make education relevant, culturally appropriate and adaptable to suit specific contexts - all essential elements of the right to education

Levels of disaggregation:

Available data:

Human rights standards: Article 13, International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Article 28, Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 17 (2), (Revised) European Social Charter; Article 13, Protocol of San Salvador; Article 11, African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child; Article 13, African Youth Charter; Article 41 (2), Arab Charter; Article 4, UNESCO Convention against Discrimination in Education

Tags: Quality of Education, Content of Education, Participation, Process Indicators

Do curriculum guidelines provided by the Ministry of Education include promoting respect for other nations, racial, ethnic or religious groups and indigenous peoples?

Definition:

Comments: According to international human rights law, one of the aims of education is to "enable all persons to participate effectively in a free society, promote understanding, tolerance and friendship among all nations and all racial, ethnic or religious groups" (Article 13, International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights)

Levels of disaggregation:

Available data:

Human rights standards: Article 13 (1), International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Articles 29 (1) (c) & (d), Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 7, International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination; Article 31, ILO Convention 169; Article 5 (1) (a), UNESCO Convention against Discrimination in Education; Article 13 (2), Protocol of San Salvador; Article 11 (2) (d), African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child; Article 13 (3) (c), African Youth Charter; Article 31 (3), Asean Human Rights Declaration; Paras 4, 11 & 19, CRC Child General Comment 1

Tags: Quality of Education, Content of Education, Indigenous Peoples and Minorities, Process Indicators

Are there any established mechanisms to ensure that textbooks used in both public and private schools are of good quality and aligned with the curriculum guidelines provided by the Ministry of Education?

Definition:

Comments: Such mechanisms are necessary to ensure that textbooks used in all schools - whether public or private - comply with minimum quality standards and that they contribute to promoting respect for human rights, equality of the sexes and tolerance among all peoples, ethnic, national and religious groups and persons of indigenous origin

Levels of disaggregation:

Available data:

Human rights standards: Article 13, International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Article 28, Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 13, Protocol of San Salvador; Article 11, African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child; Article 17 (2), (Revised) European Social Charter; Article 13, African Youth Charter; Article 41, Arab Charter; Article 4, UNESCO Convention against Discrimination in Education Provisions on textbooks: Paras 18, 22 & 25, Committee on the Rights of the Child General Comment 1; Article 10 (c), Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women; Article 31, ILO

Convention 169; Article 12 (1) (b), Protocol to the African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights on the Rights of Women in Africa; Article 12, Framework Convention for the Protection of National; Article 24 (4), Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities

Tags: Quality of Education, Content of Education, Learning Material, Accountability, Process Indicators

Do the guidelines for the approval of textbooks that can be used in schools include the prohibition of any kind of promotion or depiction of discriminatory views?

Definition:

Comments: In order to ensure that education is compliant with the aims of education and of good quality, the learning materials used must not promote or depict discriminatory views

Levels of disaggregation:

Available data:

Human rights standards: Article 13 (1), International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Article 29 (1), Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 10 (c), Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women; Article 13 (2), Protocol of San Salvador; Article 11 (2) (d), African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child; Articles 12 (1) (b) & (2) (b), Protocol to the African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights on the Rights of Women in Africa; Article 6 (b), Inter-American Convention on the Prevention, Punishment, and Eradication of Violence Against Women

Tags: Content of Education, Learning Material, Quality of Education, Women and Girls, Indigenous Peoples and Minorities, Persons with Disabilities, Persons with HIV/AIDS, Migrants, Refugees and IDPs, Persons Living in Poverty, Process Indicators

Is there a monitoring mechanism charged with determining whether teachers have a good command of the language in which they teach?

Definition:

Comments: Monitoring whether teachers have a good command of the language in which they teach is necessary to ensure education of good quality

Levels of disaggregation:

Available data:

Human rights standards: Article 13 (2), International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Articles 28 (1) & 29 (1) (c), Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 17 (2), (Revised) European Social Charter; Article 13 (3), Protocol of San Salvador; Article 11 (3), African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child; Article 24 (3) (4), Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities; Article 28, ILO Convention 169; Article 50, Geneva

Convention IV; Article 20 (1) (f), African Youth Charter; Article 8, European Charter for Regional or Minority; Article 14, Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities

Tags: Quality of Education, Teachers, Migrants, Refugees and IDPs, Persons with Disabilities, Indigenous Peoples and Minorities, Accountability, Process Indicators

Does the required training for teachers include improving the skills necessary for teaching according to the aims of education set out in international human rights standards?

Definition:

Comments: According to the UN Committee on the Rights of the Child, education must focus on the following aims: (a) The full development of the child’s personality, talents and mental and physical abilities; (b) The development of respect for human rights and fundamental freedoms; (c) The development of respect for the child’s parents, cultural identity, language and values, as well as respect for the values of the child’s country and other civilisations; (d) The development of the child’s responsibilities in a free society, including understanding, peace, tolerance, equality, and friendship among all persons and groups; (e) The development of respect for the natural environment

Levels of disaggregation:

Available data:

Human rights standards: Article 13 (1), International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Article 29 (1), Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 11 (2), African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child

Tags: Quality of Education, Content of Education, Teachers, Process Indicators

Do teachers have access to continual professional development throughout their careers?

Definition:

Comments: Continual professional development for teachers throughout their careers may be necessary to ensure the quality of education and its relevance to changing circumstances

Levels of disaggregation:

Available data:

Human rights standards: Article 13 (1), International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Article 29 (1), Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 13 (2), Protocol of San Salvador; Article 11 (2) (a), African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child, Section VI, Recommendation concerning the Status of Teachers

Tags: Quality of Education, Teachers, Process Indicators

Are there incentives to encourage experienced and/or well-trained teachers to teach in schools or areas where educational outcomes are traditionally lower?

Definition:

Comments: Without such incentives, experienced and / or well-trained teachers may prefer to work in the main urban areas or the most well-off neighbourhoods, which may in turn have a discriminatory effect on the quality of education children living in remote rural areas or poor neighbourhoods receive

Levels of disaggregation:

Available data:

Human rights standards: Article 13, International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Article 28, Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 17 (2), (Revised) European Social Charter; Article 13, Protocol of San Salvador; Article 11, African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child; Article 13, African Youth Charter; Article 41 (2), Arab Charter; Article 4, UNESCO Convention against Discrimination in Education

Tags: Quality of Education, Teachers, Indigenous Peoples and Minorities, Persons Living in Poverty, Process Indicators

International human rights treaties relevant to the right to education ratified by the State

Definition: The relevant international and regional human rights treaties include: International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (and its Optional Protocol), International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination (and recognised the competence of CERD to receive complaints under Article 14 of International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination), Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women (and its Optional Protocol), Convention on the Rights of the Child, Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities (and its Optional Protocol), UNESCO Convention against Discrimination in Education, Convention relating to the Status of Refugees, Geneva Convention Relative to the Treatment of Prisoners of War, Geneva Convention relative to the Protection of Civilian Persons in Time of War, ILO Minimum Age Convention, ILO Worst Forms of Child Labour Convention, UNESCO Convention on Technical and Vocational Education, ILO Indigenous and Tribal Peoples Convention.

In Europe: Protocol 1 to the European Convention on Human Rights, (Revised) European Social Charter (including Article 17), Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities, European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages, European Convention on the Legal Status of Migrant Workers, OSCE Helsinki Final Act.

In the Americas: Charter of the Organization of American States, American Convention on Human Rights Protocol of San Salvador.

In Africa: African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights, Protocol to the African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights on the Rights of Women in Africa, African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child

Comments: The international human rights treaties relevant to the right to education ratified by the State provide a normative framework for the human rights commitments of the State regarding its obligations to implement the right to education. When using this indicator you should check whether the State has ratified the most relevant international human rights treaty, for example, if your project focuses on the right to education of girls, you should check whether the State has ratified the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women and its Optional Protocol

Levels of disaggregation:

Available data: For information on ratification status see, here:

http://www.right-to-education.org/page/where-find-information#section_view-default-1

Human rights standards:

Tags: Structural Indicators

Coverage of the right to education in the constitution or other forms of superior law

Definition: This indicator measure the extent to which and which aspects of the right to education are guaranteed in law at the highest level

Comments: Does the constitution provide for free and compulsory primary education? Does it provide for progressively free secondary education, including technical and vocational education? Does it provide for progressively free tertiary education on the basis of capacity? Does it provide for basic education for adults who have not received or completed the whole period of their primary education?

Levels of disaggregation:

Available data: Right to Education Project, *Where to Find Information:*

<http://www.right-to-education.org/page/where-find-information>

Human rights standards: Article 2 (1), International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights

Tags: Structural Indicators

Coverage of the right to education in domestic law

Definition: This indicator examines the various provisions in domestic law that protect various aspects of the right to education

Comments: The issues that should be covered in domestic laws include, *inter alia*, institutional arrangements to make primary schooling free and compulsory, the prohibition of corporal punishment, discrimination in access to education, making educational institutions barrier-free and inclusive education (eg children with disabilities, children in detention, migrant children, indigenous children)

Levels of disaggregation:

Available data: Available data: Right to Education Project, *Where to Find Information:* <http://www.right-to-education.org/page/where-find-information>

Human rights standards: Article 2 (1), International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights

Tags: Structural Indicators

Do domestic laws forbid discrimination in access to education?

Definition: This indicator examines whether discrimination, both direct and indirect, are legally prohibited

Comments: Check on which grounds discrimination is forbidden: age, gender, race, ethnicity, colour, origin, language, status, opinion, sexual orientation, disability, socio-economic status, and other pertinent grounds

Levels of disaggregation:

Available data: Available data: Right to Education Project, *Where to Find Information:* <http://www.right-to-education.org/page/where-find-information>

Human rights standards: Article 5 (e) (v), International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination; Article 10, Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women; Article 24 (1), Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities; Article 12 (1) (a), Protocol to the African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights on the Rights of Women in Africa

Tags: Access to Education, Women and Girls, Indigenous Peoples and Minorities, Persons with Disabilities, Persons Living in Poverty, Persons with HIV/AIDS, Migrants, Refugees and IDPs, Persons in Detention, Structural Indicators

Number of reported incidents of schools closed or not allowed to open

Definition: This indicator refers to the number of such incidents in the last 12 months

Comments: A high incidence of reported school closures may reflect a problem in the availability of education

Levels of disaggregation: Level of Education, Region, Public/Private, Urban/Rural

Available data:

Human rights standards: Article 13 (4), International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Article 29 (2), Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 13 (5), Protocol of San Salvador; Article 11 (7), African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child; Article 2 (c), UNESCO Convention against Discrimination in Education (This article does however say 'when permitted' with regards to private schools which is problematic); Article 13, Framework Convention for the Protection of National; Article 14 (3), European Union Charter of Fundamental Rights; Article 27 (3) ILO Convention 169; Articles 50 & 94, Geneva Convention IV; Article 52 & 78, Additional Protocol to the Geneva Conventions

Tags: Natural Disasters, Armed Conflict (Including Child Soldiers), Access to Education, School Safety Violence, Educational Freedom/Private Education, Process Indicators

Teacher absenteeism rate

Definition: This indicator measures the proportion of teachers who are not in school although they were expected to be teaching when visited by a survey team, out of all teachers who were expected to be teaching

Comments: The standard tool to measure this indicator is unannounced visits to schools to determine the percentage of teachers not on site. For this indicator, administratively approved leave for professional development, field trips or other off-school activities with students is not counted as a teacher's absence. A high teacher absenteeism rate may reflect a problem in the availability of education

Levels of disaggregation: Level of Education, Region, Urban/Rural, Public/Private

Available data:

Human rights standards: Article 13, International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Article 28, Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 17 (2), (Revised) European Social Charter; Article 13, Protocol of San Salvador; Article 11, African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child; Article 13, African Youth Charter; Article 41 (2), Arab Charter; Article 4, UNESCO Convention against Discrimination in Education

Tags: Access to Education, Quality of Education, Teachers, Pre-Primary, Primary, Secondary, Process Indicators

Has the government adopted specific measures to combat teacher absenteeism?

Definition:

Comments: Check if measures or programmes adopted by the State to reduce teacher absenteeism take into account the specific factors that contribute to this phenomenon in the country, which may include, *inter alia*, school material conditions, administrative breakdowns (eg non-payment of salaries), health (including care for family members in the absence of any other social care structure) and inadequate transportation systems. In a country with high levels of teacher absenteeism, lack of specific measures to combat this problem may constitute a violation of the State's obligation to make education accessible

Levels of disaggregation:

Available data:

Human rights standards: Article 13, International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Article 28, Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 17 (2), (Revised) European Social Charter; Article 13, Protocol of San Salvador; Article 11, African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child; Article 13, African Youth Charter; Article 41 (2), Arab Charter; Article 4, UNESCO Convention against Discrimination in Education

Tags: Access to Education, Quality of Education, Teachers, Pre-Primary, Primary, Secondary, Process Indicators

Are there campaigns to convince parents to send their girls to school?

Definition:

Comments: In countries with traditional societies, such campaigns may be an important strategy to increase girls' access to education

Levels of disaggregation: Level of Education, Region, Urban/Rural

Available data:

Human rights standards: Article 10 (a), Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women; Article 12 (1) (a), Protocol to the African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights on the Rights of Women in Africa; Para 30, CESCR General Comment 16

Tags: Access to Education, Women and Girls, Process Indicators

Gender pay gap

Definition: The gender pay gap is the difference between male and female earnings expressed as a percentage of male earnings. It is calculated by dividing the median annual earnings for women by the median annual earnings for men

Comments: A high gender pay gap may reduce the willingness of parents to make sacrifices for their girls' schooling when they have reason to doubt that schooling will significantly benefit the girl in question

Levels of disaggregation:

Available data:

Human rights standards: Article 10 (a), Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women; Article 11 (3) (e), African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child; Article 12 (1) (a), Protocol to the African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights on the Rights of Women in Africa

Tags: Access to Education, Women and Girls, Process Indicators

Is there legislation prohibiting child marriage?

Definition: Child marriage is defined as a marriage where at least one party is under the age of 18

Comments: Child marriage could interfere with school attendance

Levels of disaggregation:**Available data:**

Human rights standards: Article 28 (1) (e); Article 10 (f) & 16 (2), Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women; Article 24 (3) & 16 (2) Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 12 (2) (c), Protocol to the African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights on the Rights of Women in Africa

Tags: Access to Education, Women and Girls, Structural Indicators

Number of reported incidents of child marriage**Definition:**

Comments: In some countries, despite the fact that a minimum age for marriage is stipulated by law, the practice of child marriage below that minimum age continues

Levels of disaggregation: Region, Urban/Rural

Available data:

Human rights standards: Articles 28 (1) (e), 10 (f) & 16 (2), Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women; Articles 24 (3) & 16 (2), Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 12 (2) (c), Protocol to the African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights on the Rights of Women in Africa

Tags: Access to Education, Women and Girls, Process Indicators

Percentage of female teachers, headteachers and supervisors

Definition: Female teachers, headteachers and supervisors as a percentage of total number of teachers, headteachers and supervisors respectively in a given level of education (includes full-time and part-time teachers)

Comments: Female teachers are important as they serve as role models to girls and help to attract and retain girls in school. Female headteachers and supervisors are important to ensure that a gender perspective is fully incorporated in schools

Levels of disaggregation: Level of Education, Region, Urban/Rural, Public/Private

Available data: Edstats: <http://databank.worldbank.org/data/reports.aspx?source=education-statistics>

Human rights standards: Article 10 (a) & 11 (1), Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women; Article 12 (1) (a), Protocol to the African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights on the Rights of Women in Africa; Article (6) (2), Protocol of San Salvador

Tags: Quality of Education, Teachers, Women and Girls, Process Indicators

Is the expulsion of girls from school because of pregnancy or for having a baby explicitly forbidden in legislation?

Definition:

Comments: Without an explicit prohibition, school principals may have the authority to arbitrarily decide to expel girls who are pregnant or have a baby, thereby violating their right to education

Levels of disaggregation:

Available data:

Human rights standards: Article 11 (6), African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child; Article 13 (4) (h), African Youth Charter; Articles 12 (1) (a) (c) & (d), Protocol to the African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights on the Rights of Women in Africa; Article 24, Convention on the Rights of the Child; Para 56, Committee on the Rights of the Child General Comment 14; Article 7, International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights

Tags: Access to Education, Women and Girls, Structural Indicators

Number of reported incidents of girls expelled from schools because of pregnancy or having had a baby

Definition: This indicator measures the number of reported incidents in the last 12 months

Comments: If the number of reported incidents is high, you should check whether it is because of a lack of appropriate legislation forbidding such incidents or whether it is because of the lack of enforcement of relevant legislation

Levels of disaggregation:

Available data:

Human rights standards: Article 11 (6), African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child; Article 13 (4) (h), African Youth Charter; Articles 12 (1) (a) (c) & (d), Protocol to the African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights on the Rights of Women in Africa; Article 24, Convention on the Rights of the Child; Para 56, Committee on the Rights of the Child General Comment 14; Article 7, International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights

Tags: Access to Education, Women and Girls, Process Indicators

Number of reported incidents of expulsion of unmarried, pregnant schoolteachers

Definition: This indicator measures the number of reported incidents in the last 12 months

Comments: If the number of reported incidents is high, you should check whether it is because of a lack of appropriate legislation forbidding such incidents or whether it is because of the lack of enforcement of relevant legislation

Levels of disaggregation:

Available data:

Human rights standards: Article 10 (a), Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women; Article 10 (2), International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Paras 10 (a) & 31, CESCR General Comment 20

Tags: Teachers, Women and Girls, Process Indicators

Do domestic laws protect the right of minorities to establish their own schools?

Definition:

Comments: According to human rights standards, minorities have the freedom to establish their own schools and this should be protected by domestic law. At the same time, such schools should comply with minimum educational standards as set or approved by the State

Levels of disaggregation:

Available data:

Human rights standards: Article 13 (4), International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; para 30 of CESCR General Comment 13; Article 29 (2), Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 13 (5), Protocol of San Salvador; Article 11 (7), African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child; Article 14 (3), European Union Charter of Fundamental Rights; Article 2, Protocol 1, European Convention on Human Rights ; Article 5, UNESCO Convention against discrimination in Education; Article (27) (3), ILO Convention 169; Article 13, Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities

Tags: Educational Freedom/Private Education, Indigenous Peoples and Minorities, Structural Indicators

Percentage of children belonging to language minorities taught both their own minority language and the official State language

Definition:

Comments: Children belonging to language minorities have the right to learn their own language since the right to speak, promote and protect one's language is an essential aspect of belonging to a minority. At the same time, they also have the right to learn the official State language in order to fully integrate into wider society

Levels of disaggregation: Region, Urban/Rural, Minority

Available data:

Human rights standards: Article 27, International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights; Article 30, Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 14, Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities; Articles 8(1) (a) (i) (b) (i) (c) (i) (d) (i) (e) (i) (f) (i), European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages; Article 28, ILO Convention 169; Article 5 (c) (i), UNESCO Convention against Discrimination in Education

Tags: Quality of Education, Indigenous Peoples and Minorities, Process Indicators

Number of reported incidents of racism or xenophobia in schools

Definition: This indicator measures the number of reported incidents of racism or xenophobia in school during the last 12 months

Comments:

Levels of disaggregation:

Available data:

Human rights standards: Articles 5 & 7, International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination; Article 29 (1) (c) (d), Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 13 (1), International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Article 20 (2), International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights; Article 13 (2), Protocol of San Salvador; Article 11 (2) (d), African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child; Article 5 (1) (a), UNESCO Convention against Discrimination in Education; Article 13 (3) (c), African Youth Charter; Article 31 (3), Asean Human Rights Declaration; Paragraphs 4, 11 & 19 Committee on the Rights of the Child General Comment 1

Tags: Quality of Education, School Safety and Violence, Indigenous Peoples and Minorities, Process Indicators

Minority teachers ratio

Definition: Minority teachers ratio is the percentage of teachers belonging to minority groups out of the total of teachers for a given level of education

Comments: A minority teachers ratio significantly lower than the proportion of that minority in the country may contribute to the lack of cultural adaptability of education to the needs of children belonging to that minority

Levels of disaggregation:

Available data:

Human rights standards: Article 8 (2), European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages; Article 27, International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights; Article 30 Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 7 International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination; Para 62, Committee on the Rights of the Child General Comment 11; Article 28, ILO 169; Article 5 (c), UNESCO Convention against Discrimination in Education; Articles 12 (1) (2) & 14, Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities

Tags: Quality of Education, Teachers, Indigenous Peoples and Minorities, Process Indicators

Percentage of teachers not belonging to minority groups trained in minority culture or languages

Definition:

Comments: A significantly low percentage of teachers not belonging to minority groups trained in minority culture or languages may contribute to the lack of cultural adaptability of education to the needs of children belonging to minority groups, particularly if it is combined with a low percentage of teachers belonging to minority groups

Levels of disaggregation:

Available data:

Human rights standards: Article 8 (2), European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages; Article 27, International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights; Article 30, Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 7, International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination; Article 29 (1) (c), Convention on the Rights of the Child; Para 62, Committee on the Rights of the Child General Comment 11; Article 28, ILO Convention 169; Article 5(c), UNESCO Convention against Discrimination in Education; Article 50, Geneva Convention 4; Articles 12 (1) (2) & 14, Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities

Tags: Quality of Education, Teachers, Indigenous Peoples and Minorities, Process Indicators

Are there established mechanisms to enable parents, children and community leaders belonging to minorities to contribute to ensuring that education takes their needs into account?

Definition: Such mechanisms could include, for example, perception surveys, focus groups and public campaigns

Comments: Such mechanisms are necessary to ensure that education will be adapted to the specific needs of minorities

Levels of disaggregation:

Available data:

Human rights standards: Articles 22 (2) (3), 27 & 28 (1) ILO Convention 169; Article 29 (1), Convention on the Rights of the Child; Para 22, Committee on the Rights of the Child General Comment 1

Tags: Quality of Education, Content of Education, Indigenous Peoples and Minorities, Participation, Process Indicators

Are there mobile schools for children of nomads?

Definition:

Comments: Lack of mobile schools may hinder children of nomads enjoying the right to education

Levels of disaggregation:

Available data:

Human rights standards: Article 14 (2), Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities; Article 14, Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples; Para 61 of Committee on the Rights of the Child General Comment 11; Articles 22 (2) (3), 26, 27 (1) & 28 (1) (2), ILO Convention 169

Tags: Access to Education, Physical Accessibility, Indigenous People and Minorities, Process Indicators

Is there legislation recognising the right of children with disabilities to education?

Definition: (Source: Audrey Chapman (2007) *Development of Indicators for Economic, Social and Cultural Rights: The Rights to Education, Participation in Cultural Life and Access to the Benefits of Science*: p.145)

Comments: Check if the legislation makes provision for the necessary equipment and support to enable students with disabilities to attend school

Levels of disaggregation:

Available data:

Human rights standards: Articles 4 (1) (a) (b) (d) (e), 2, 3, 4, 5 & 24, Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities; Article 13, International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Paras 13, 16, & 35, CESCR General Comment 5; Para 59, CESCR General Comment 13; Article 3 (1) (a), Inter-American Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Persons with Disabilities

Tags: Access to Education, Persons with Disabilities, Structural Indicators

Percentage of children with disabilities enrolled in mainstream schools

Definition: This indicator measures the rate of children with disabilities enrolled in mainstream schools in a given level of education as a percentage of the total number of children with disabilities in that level of education

Comments: Children with disabilities should not be excluded from the general education system on the basis of disability

Levels of disaggregation: Type of Disability, Level of Education, Region, Urban/Rural

Available data:

Human rights standards: Article 13 (2), International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Article 28 (1), Convention on the Rights of the Child; Paras 66 & 67 of Committee on the Rights of the Child GC 9; Article 24 (2), Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities; Articles 17 (2) & 15 (1), (Revised) European Social Charter; Article 13 (3), Protocol of San Salvador; Article 11 (3), African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child; Article 7 (2) (c), ILO Convention 182; Article 13 (4) (a) (b), African Youth Charter; Articles 40 & 41(2) Arab Charter

Tags: Access to Education, Persons with Disabilities, Process Indicators

Is there a special funding system to ensure access to education for children with disabilities?

Definition:

Comments: Without such special funding system, it may not be possible for some children with disabilities to have effective access to education

Levels of disaggregation:

Available data:

Human rights standards: Article 13 (2) (e), International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Articles 28 (1) & 23(c), Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 24 (2), Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities; Articles 17 (2), 15 (1) & 10 (5) (b),

(Revised) European Social Charter; Article 13 (3), Protocol of San Salvador; Article 11 (3), African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child; Article 13 (4) (a) (b), African Youth Charter; Articles 40 & 41 (2) Arab Charter

Tags: Access to Education, Economic Accessibility, Free Education, Persons with Disabilities, Process Indicators

Are reasonable accommodation measures available for children with disabilities in mainstream schools?

Definition: Reasonable accommodation means necessary and appropriate modification and adjustments not imposing a disproportionate or undue burden, where needed in a particular case, to ensure to persons with disabilities the enjoyment or exercise on an equal basis with others of all human rights and fundamental freedoms

Comments: Lack of reasonable accommodation measures may impair the access of children with disabilities to mainstream schools

Levels of disaggregation:

Available data:

Human rights standards: Articles 24 (2) (c) & (5), Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities; Article 23 (a), Protocol to the African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights on the Rights of Women in Africa; Article 3 (1), Inter-American Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Persons with Disabilities; Article 40, Arab Charter

Tags: Quality of Education, School Safety and Violence, Physical Accessibility, Access to Education, Persons with Disabilities, Process Indicators

Trained teachers rate for children with disabilities

Definition: This indicator measures the percentage of teachers in mainstream schools who have one or more children with disabilities who are specifically trained to teach children with disabilities out of the total number of teachers in such schools teaching children with disabilities

Comments: Such training shall incorporate disability awareness and the use of appropriate augmentative and alternative modes, means and formats of communication (eg sign language and / or Braille), educational techniques and materials to support persons with disabilities

Levels of disaggregation: Type of Disability, Level of Education, Region, Urban/Rural, Public/Private

Available data:

Human rights standards: Article 29, Convention on the Rights of the Child; Paras 62 & 67 of Committee on the Rights of the Child General Comment 9; Article 13, International Covenant

on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Para 35 of CESCR General Comment; Article 24 (4), Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities

Tags: Quality of Education, Teachers, Persons with Disabilities, Process Indicators

Do teachers of children with disabilities in mainstream schools receive special support?

Definition: Special support may include, inter alia, special working conditions such as additional pay and a lower teacher / pupil ratio

Comments: Teachers in mainstream schools who have pupils with disabilities need special support to allow them to provide the necessary support to those children and to help them integrate into classes

Levels of disaggregation: Level of Education, Region, Urban/Rural

Available data:

Human rights standards: Articles 24 (2) (c) (3) (4) & (5), Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities; Article 13, International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Para 35, CESCR General Comment 5; Article 29, Convention on the Rights of the Child; Paras 62 & 67, Committee on the Rights of the Child General Comment 9

Tags: Quality of Education, Teachers, Persons with Disabilities, Process Indicators

Percentage of children with disabilities enrolled in special schools

Definition: This indicator measures the rate of children with disabilities enrolled in special schools at a given level of education as a percentage of the total number of children with disabilities at that level of education

Comments: A significantly high percentage of children with disabilities enrolled in special schools may reflect that the State is not making sufficient efforts for reasonable accommodation of children with disabilities in mainstream schools. A significantly low percentage may reflect that the State does not provide sufficient special schools for children with disabilities who cannot be integrated in mainstream schools

Levels of disaggregation: Type of Disability, Level of Education, Region, Urban/Rural, Public/Private

Available data:

Human rights standards: Article 28 (1), Convention on the Rights of the Child; Para 67 of Committee on the Rights of the Child General Comment 9; Article 13 (2); International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Article 24; Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities; Articles 15 (1) & 17 (2), (Revised) European Social Charter; Article 13 (3) (e), Protocol of San Salvador; Article 13, African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child; Article 13 (4) (g), African Youth Charter

Tags: Access to Education, Persons with Disabilities, Process Indicators

Can parents and children complain before an independent body about decisions to send their children to special schools?

Definition:

Comments: Such complaint mechanisms are necessary to ensure that children with disabilities are only sent by the State to study in special schools under strict conditions which are clearly and strictly set

Levels of disaggregation:

Available data:

Human rights standards: Article 24 (2), Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities

Tags: Persons with Disabilities, Accountability, Process Indicators

Percentage of household expenditure on education for households with children with disabilities

Definition: This indicator measures the average household expenditure on education, as a percentage of their total expenditure in the last 12 months

Comments: If the percentage of household expenditure on education for households with children with disabilities is significantly high, check whether the State provides special funding to households with children with disabilities, so that the burden of sending them to school is not prohibitively high

Levels of disaggregation: Public/Private

Available data:

Human rights standards: Articles 23 (3) & 24 (2), Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities; Article 13 (2), International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Article 28 (1), Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 17 (2), (Revised) European Social Charter; Article 13 (3), Protocol of San Salvador; Article 11 (3), African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child; Article 13 (4) (a) (b), African Youth Charter; Article 41 (2), Arab Charter; Article 31 (2), ASEAN Human Rights Declaration; Article 14 (2), European Union Charter of Fundamental Rights

Tags: Access to Education, Persons with Disabilities, Process Indicators

Do migrant, refugee, internally displaced or other 'internal migrant' children have to present documents stating their legal status to enrol in school?

Definition: Examples of documents include passports, residency permits and birth certificates

Comments: Such requirements may impair access to education to children of undocumented migrants

Levels of disaggregation:

Available data:

Human rights standards: Article 30, Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families; Article 22, Convention relating to the Status of Refugees; Articles 2 (2) (3) & 13 (2), International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Articles 2 & 28 (1), Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 3 (e), UNESCO Convention against Discrimination in Education; Para 34 of CESCR General Comment 13; Article 9 (2) (b), Kampala Convention

Tags: Access to Education, Administrative Accessibility, Migrants, Refugees and IDPs, Process Indicators

Number of reported incidents of migrant, refugee, internally displaced children expelled from school because they or their parents have lost their residency permit

Definition:

Comments: A high incidence of expulsions from school due to loss of residency permits reflects a denial of access to education to this group of children

Levels of disaggregation:

Available data:

Human rights standards: Article 30, Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families; Article 22, Convention relating to the Status of Refugees; Articles 2 (2) (3) & 13 (2), International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Articles 2 & 28 (1), Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 3 (e), UNESCO Convention against Discrimination in Education; Para 34 of CESCR General Comment 13; Article 9 (2) (b), Kampala Convention

Tags: Access to Education, Administrative Accessibility, Migrants, Refugees and IDPs, Process Indicators

Is education provided in retention centres/camps for migrant, refugee and internally displaced children?

Definition:

Comments: Without such arrangements, this group of children would be denied access to education

Levels of disaggregation:

Available data:

Human rights standards: Article 30, Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families; Article 22, Convention relating to the Status of Refugees; Articles 2 (2) (3) & 13 (2), International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Articles 2, 22 (1) & 28 (1), Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 3 (e), UNESCO Convention against Discrimination in Education; Para 34, CESCR General Comment 13; Article 9 (2) (b), Kampala Convention

Tags: Access to Education, Migrants, Refugees and IDPs, Persons in Detention, Process Indicators

Do imprisoned children receive education integrated with the general education system?

Definition: "Every juvenile of compulsory school age has the right to education suited to his or her needs and abilities and designed to prepare him or her for return to society. Such education should be provided outside the detention facility in community schools wherever possible and, in any case, by qualified teachers through programmes integrated with the education system of the country so that, after release, juveniles may continue their education without difficulty" (Rule 38, *Rules for the Protection of Juveniles Deprived of their Liberty*: http://www.ohchr.org/Documents/ProfessionalInterest/res45_113.pdf)

Comments: Without such arrangements, this group of children would be denied access to education and the opportunity to integrate back into society after release

Levels of disaggregation: Level of Education

Available data:

Human rights standards: Article 77 (2), Standard Minimum Rules for the Treatment of Prisoners; Rule 38, Rules for the Protection of Juveniles Deprived of their Liberty; Article 10 (3), International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights

Tags: Access to Education, Quality of Education, Persons in Detention, Process Indicators

Is educational and vocational information and guidance given to imprisoned children?

Definition:

Comments: Such information and guidance may be necessary to ensure that this group of children can be fully reintegrated into society once they are released from prison

Levels of disaggregation:

Available data:

Human rights standards: Rules 38, 42 & 43, Rules for the Protection of Juveniles Deprived of their Liberty; Article 10 (3), International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights; Article 71 (5), Standard Minimum Rules for the Treatment of Prisoners; Rule 26 (1) (2), United Nations Standard Minimum Rules for the Administration of Juvenile Justice

Tags: Access to Education, Persons in Detention, Process Indicators

Do adult prisoners have access to education?

Definition: For example literacy programmes

Comments: Provision shall be made for the further education of all prisoners capable of profiting, particularly of adult prisoners who have low literacy skills

Levels of disaggregation:

Available data:

Human rights standards: Articles 77 (1) & 75 (2), Standard Minimum Rules for the Treatment of Prisoners; Article 10 (3), International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights

Tags: Access to Education, Adult Education, Persons in Detention, Process Indicators

Percentage of prisons with libraries

Definition:

Comments: According to international human rights standards, every prison should have a library for the use of all categories of prisoners, adequately stocked with both recreational and instructional books

Levels of disaggregation:

Available data:

Human rights standards: Rule 40, Standard Minimum Rules for the Treatment of Prisoners; Rule 41, Rules for the Protection of Juveniles Deprived of their Liberty

Tags: Learning Material, Quality of Education, Adult Education, Persons in Detention, Process Indicators

Is there legislation expressly prohibiting any form of discrimination against students and teachers affected by HIV/AIDS?

Definition:

Comments: Such legislation may be necessary to prevent this type of discrimination which is common in many countries

Levels of disaggregation:

Available data:

Human rights standards: Article 2 (2), International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Paras 33 & 37 of CESCR General Comment 20; Article 2 & 4 Convention on the Rights of the Child; Paras 9 & 40 (c), Committee on the Rights of the Child General Comment 3; Article 3 (b) (c), ILO Convention 111

Tags: Access to Education, Teachers, Persons with HIV/AIDS, Structural Indicators

Number of reported incidents of discrimination against children because they or their parents are HIV-positive or against teachers who are HIV-positive

Definition:

Comments: If the number of reported incidents is high, you should check whether it is because of a lack of appropriate legislation forbidding such incidents or whether it is because of the lack of enforcement of relevant legislation

Levels of disaggregation:

Available data:

Human rights standards: Article 2 (2), International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Para 33, CESCR General Comment 20; Article 2, Convention on the Rights of the Child; Para 9, Committee on the Rights of the Child General Comment 3; Article 1 (a) (b), ILO Convention 111

Tags: Access to Education, Teachers, Persons with HIV/AIDS, Process Indicators

Are there any government programmes that provide children, families, teachers, educational officials and the broader community with factual and comprehensive information about HIV/AIDS?

Definition:

Comments: Such programmes may be necessary given widespread misinformation about HIV/AIDS

Levels of disaggregation:

Available data:

Human rights standards: Article 2(2), International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Paras 33, 38, 39 & 40 of CESCR General Comment 20 ; Articles 24 (2) (e) (f), 13 & 17, Convention on the Rights of the Child; Paras 16-18 Committee on the Rights of the Child General Comment 3; Article 3 (b), ILO Convention 111; Article 13 (3) (F), African Youth Charter

Tags: Quality of Education, Persons with HIV/AIDS, Process Indicators

Is corporal punishment illegal?

Definition: Corporal punishment is defined by the UN Committee on the Rights of the Child as: "any punishment in which physical force is used and intended to cause some degree of pain or discomfort, however light" (Committee on the Rights of the Child, *General Comment 8*:http://tbinternet.ohchr.org/_layouts/treatybodyexternal/Download.aspx?symbolno=CRC%2fC%2fGC%2f8&Lang=en)

Comments: Corporal punishment of children breaches their fundamental human rights to respect for human dignity and physical integrity. You should check that corporal punishment is prohibited both in the home and at school

Levels of disaggregation:

Available data: *Global Initiative to End All Corporal Punishment of Children*:
<http://www.endcorporalpunishment.org/progress/country-reports/>

Human rights standards: Articles 4, 19 & 28 (2), Convention on the Rights of the Child; Articles 2 (2) & 7, International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights; Article 11 (5), African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child; Article 3, European Convention on Human Rights; Article 17 (1) (b), (Revised) European Social Charter; Rule 67, United Nations Rules for the Protection of Juveniles Deprived of their Liberty; Article 16, Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment

Tags: Quality of Education, School Safety and Violence, Structural Indicators

Can abused children complain before an independent body?

Definition: For the purposes of this indicator, 'abused children' refers to victims of violence, corporal punishment and / or sexual violence

Comments: A lack of an independent body may deter children from filing a complaint, particularly if they are complaining against abuses committed by teachers or other school workers

Levels of disaggregation:

Available data:

Human rights standards: Articles 4, 19 (2) & 28 (2), Convention on the Rights of the Child; Articles 2 (3) & 7, International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights; Article 11 (5), African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child; Article 12 (1) (c) & (d), Protocol to the African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights on the Rights of Women in Africa; Article 16, Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment; Article 17 (1) (b), (Revised) European social Charter

Tags: Quality of Education, School Safety and Violence, Process Indicators

Number of reported incidents of corporal punishment in schools

Definition: This indicator measures the number of reported incidents of corporal punishment in schools, by teachers or school administrator in the last 5 years

Comments: Even in countries where corporal punishment is outlawed, there can be cases in which teachers still use it against children. A significantly low number of reported incidents of corporal punishment does not necessarily reflect a true lack of incidents of school corporal punishment; it may actually reflect underreporting of such incidents, which may be indicative of inadequate access to complaint mechanisms and / or inadequate awareness among children of the importance of reporting such incidents

Levels of disaggregation: Public/Private

Available data:

Human rights standards: Articles 19 & 28 (2), Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 7, International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights; Article 11 (5), African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child; Article 12 (1) (c) & (d), Protocol to the African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights on the Rights of Women in Africa; Article 16, Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment; Article 17 (1) (b), (Revised) European Social Charter; Article 3, European Convention on Human Rights

Tags: Quality of Education, School Safety and Violence, Process Indicators

Number of reported incidents of violence in schools

Definition: This indicator measures the number of reported incidents of violence by children against other children in the last 12 months

Comments: A significantly low number of reported incidents of school violence does not necessarily reflect a true lack of incidents of school violence; it may actually reflect underreporting of such incidents, which may be indicative of inadequate access to complaint mechanisms and / or inadequate awareness among children of the importance of reporting such incidents

Levels of disaggregation: Public/Private

Available data:

Human rights standards: Articles 7, International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights; Article 19, Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 12 (1) (c) & (d), Protocol to the African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights on the Rights of Women in Africa; Article 17 (1) (b) & 7 (10), (Revised) European Social Charter; Article 6, Inter-American Convention on the Prevention, Punishment, and Eradication of Violence Against Women

Tags: Quality of Education, School Safety and Violence, Process Indicators

Number of reported incidents of sexual harassment

Definition: This indicator measures the number of reported incidents of sexual harassment in school in the last 12 months

Comments: A significantly low number of reported incidents of sexual harassment does not necessarily reflect a true lack of incidents of sexual harassment; it may actually reflect underreporting of such incidents, which may be indicative of inadequate access to complaint mechanisms and / or inadequate awareness among children of the importance of reporting such incidents

Levels of disaggregation:

Available data:

Human rights standards: Articles 7, International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights; Articles 19 (1) & 34 Convention on the Rights of the Child; Articles 12 (1) (c) & (d), Protocol to the African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights on the Rights of Women in Africa; Article 17 (1) (b) (Revised) European Social Charter

Tags: Quality of Education, School Safety and Violence, Women and Girls, Process Indicators

Reported cases of incidents regarding safety of students to and from school

Definition: This indicator measures the number of incidents reported per year regarding safety problems on the way to / from school (eg violence against students, transport accidents, etc.)

Comments: A significantly low number of reported cases of incidents regarding safety of students to and from school does not necessarily reflect a true lack of incidents; it may actually reflect underreporting of such incidents, which may be indicative of inadequate access to complaint mechanisms and / or inadequate awareness among children of the importance of reporting such incidents

Levels of disaggregation: Urban/Rural, Region

Available data:

Human rights standards: Article 13 (2), International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Articles 19 & 28 (1), Convention on the Rights of the Child; Articles 17 & 7 (10), (Revised) European Social Charter; Article 13 (3), Protocol of San Salvador; Article 11 (3), African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child; Article 24 (2), Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities; Article 7 (2) (c), ILO Convention 182; Article 17 (2), (Revised) European Social Charter; Article 11 (3), African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child, Article 13 (4) African Youth Charter; Article 41 (2) Arab Charter; Article 4, UNESCO Convention against Discrimination in Education

Tags: School Safety and Violence, Physical Accessibility, Process Indicators

What is the legal minimum age of employment?

Definition:

Comments: According to ILO standards, the general minimum age for admission to any employment should not be lower than the age of completion of compulsory schooling and, in any case, no less than fifteen years old. For more details, see here:

<http://www.right-to-education.org/issue-page/minimum-age>

Levels of disaggregation:

Available data:

Human rights standards: Article 2, ILO 138 Minimum Age Convention; Article 32 (2) (a), Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 10 (3), International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Article 7, (Revised) European Social Charter; Article 7 (f), Protocol of San Salvador; Article 32, European Union Charter of Fundamental Rights; Article 27 (3), ASEAN Human Rights Declaration

Tags: Access to Education, Child Labourers, Persons Living in Poverty, Structural Indicators

Percentage of children under minimum legal age of employment working in practice

Definition:

Comments: This indicator helps measure the lack of enforcement of the legal minimum age of employment set by domestic law

Levels of disaggregation:

Available data: ILO Database: <http://www.ilo.org/dyn/clsurvey/lfsurvey.home>

Human rights standards: Article 2, ILO Convention 138 Minimum Age Convention; Article 32 (2) (a), Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 10 (3), International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Article 7, (Revised) European Social Charter; Article 7 (f), Protocol of San Salvador; Article 32, European Union Charter of Fundamental Rights; Article 27 (3), ASEAN Human Rights Declaration

Tags: Access to Education, Child Labourers, Persons Living in Poverty, Process Indicators

Is there a monitoring body inspecting child labour?

Definition:

Comments: Without such a monitoring body it may not be possible to enforce the legal minimum age of employment and avoid child labour

Levels of disaggregation:

Available data:

Human rights standards: Article 2, ILO 138 Minimum Age Convention; Article 7 (2), ILO Convention 182 on Worst Forms of Child Labour; Article 32 (2) (c), Article 7, (Revised) European Social Charter; Article 7 (f), Protocol of San Salvador; Article 32, European Union Charter of Fundamental Rights; Article 27 (3), ASEAN Human Rights Declaration

Tags: Access to Education, Child Labourers, Persons Living in Poverty, Accountability, Process Indicators

Has the government adopted specific measures to combat child labour?

Definition: Specific measures to combat child labour include, for example, providing cash transfers to poor families

Comments:

Levels of disaggregation:

Available data:

Human rights standards: Article 2, ILO Convention 138 Minimum Age Convention; Article 7 (2), ILO Convention 182 on Worst Forms of Child Labour; Article 32 (2) (c), Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 10 (3), International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Article 7, (Revised) European Social Charter; Article 7 (f), Protocol of San Salvador; Article 32, European Union Charter of Fundamental Rights; Article 27 (3), Asean Human Rights Declaration

Tags: Access to Education, Child Labourers, Persons Living in Poverty, Process Indicators

Are there special measures to include child labourers in education and find solutions for them and their families?

Definition: Special measures to include child labourers in education include, *inter alia*, adapting schools' schedules during harvest seasons in rural areas and making non-formal forms of schooling available for child labourers

Comments: In order to guarantee the right to education for all, the State must adopt specific measures to ensure that children at risk of entering work or children that have entered work, are able to attend school

Levels of disaggregation:

Available data:

Human rights standards: Article 2, ILO Convention 138 Minimum Age Convention; Article 7 (2), ILO Convention 182 on Worst Forms of Child Labour; Articles 32 (2) & 39, Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 7, (Revised) European Social Charter; Article 7 (f), Protocol of San Salvador; Article 32, European Union Charter of Fundamental Rights; Article 27, ASEAN Human Rights Declaration

Tags: Access to Education, Child Labourers, Persons Living in Poverty, Process Indicators

Number of reported incidents of use of schools by armed forces

Definition: This indicator measures the number of reported incidents of occupation or use of schools by armed forces or armed groups (from government or opposition groups) in the last two years

Comments: "The use of schools for military purposes puts children at risk of attack and hampers children's right to education, resulting in reduced enrolment and high drop-out rates, especially amongst girls and may also may lead to schools being considered targets for attack" (Source: *The Six Grave Violations Against Children During Armed Conflict: The Legal Foundation by the Office of the Special Representative of the Secretary-General for Children and Armed Conflict* (2013): https://childrenandarmedconflict.un.org/publications/WorkingPaper-1_SixGraveViolationsLegalFoundation.pdf). For an example of a report monitoring this issue, see: <https://www.hrw.org/report/2012/09/11/classrooms-crosshairs/military-use-schools-yemens-capital>

Levels of disaggregation:

Available data: The United Nations reports on attacks against schools as one of six grave violations against children in armed conflict. See: (> Countries) <https://childrenandarmedconflict.un.org/our-work/monitoring-and-reporting/>

Human rights standards: Article 8 (2) (b) (ix), Rome Statute; Articles 48, 51 & 52, Protocol 1 of the Geneva Convention

Tags: Armed Conflict (Including Child Soldiers), School Safety and Violence, Process Indicators

Number of reported military attacks on schools

Definition: This indicator measures the number of reported attacks on schools by armed forces or armed groups (from government or opposition groups) in the last five years

Comments: For an example of a report monitoring this issue, see here: <https://www.hrw.org/report/2009/12/09/sabotaged-schooling/naxalite-attacks-and-police-occupation-schools-indias-bihar> and here: <https://www.hrw.org/report/2012/02/20/no-place-children/child-recruitment-forced-marriage-and-attacks-schools-somalia>

Levels of disaggregation:

Available data: The United Nations reports on attacks against schools as one of six grave violations against children in armed conflict. See: (> Countries) <https://childrenandarmedconflict.un.org/our-work/monitoring-and-reporting/>

Human rights standards: Article 8 (2) (b) (ix), Rome Statute; Articles 48, 51 & 52, Protocol 1 of the Geneva Convention

Tags: Armed Conflict (Including Child Soldiers), School Safety and Violence, Process Indicators

Number of reported incidents of military attacks on students and teachers

Definition:

Comments: Military attacks on students and teachers include not only deliberate attacks but also reported incidents of placing students and teachers in harm's way by exposing them to return fire

Levels of disaggregation:

Available data: The United Nations reports attacks against schools as one of six grave violations against children in armed conflict. See: (> Countries)

<https://childrenandarmedconflict.un.org/our-work/monitoring-and-reporting/>

Human rights standards: Articles 6 (1) & 9 (1), International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights; Articles 6, 19 & 38, Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 22 (3), African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child; Article 8 (2) (b) (ix), Rome Statute; Articles 48, 51 & 52, Protocol 1 of the Geneva Convention

Tags: Armed Conflict (Including Child Soldiers), School Safety and Violence, Process Indicators

What is the legal minimum age of military recruitment?

Definition: The legal minimum age of military recruitment is the age at which a person is permitted to enlist or be conscripted and take part in hostilities

Comments: The Convention on the Rights of the Child sets fifteen years old as the minimum age for military recruitment and for taking direct part in hostilities. The 2000 Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Rights of the Child on the involvement of children in armed conflict, drafted in order to raise the minimum ages set out in the Convention, sets the higher age of eighteen years old as the minimum for recruitment or participation in armed conflict. If the legal minimum age of military recruitment is lower than the legal maximum age of completion of compulsory education, military recruitment may effectively undermine compulsory education

Levels of disaggregation:

Available data: CIA: <https://www.cia.gov/library/publications/the-world-factbook/fields/2024.html#139>

Human rights standards: Article 38 (2) (3), Convention on the Rights of the Child; Articles 1 & 2 Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Rights of the Child on the involvement of children in armed conflict; Article 22 (2), African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child; Articles 8 (2) (b) (xxvi) & 8 (2) (e) (vii), Rome Statute; Article 3, ILO 138 Minimum Age Convention; Article 3 (a), ILO Convention 182 on the Worst Forms of Child Labour Convention; Article 77 (2), Additional Protocol I Geneva Convention; Article 4 (3) (c), Additional Protocol II Geneva Convention

Tags: Armed Conflict (Including Child Soldiers), Access to Education, Structural Indicators

Number of child soldiers

Definition: Number of child soldiers is the number of children who are soldiers, in either regular armed forces or armed groups

Comments: Children who are soldiers are not able to enjoy the right to education

Levels of disaggregation:

Available data:

Human rights standards: Article 38 (2) (3), Convention on the Rights of the Child; Articles 1 & 2, Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Rights of the Child on the involvement of children in armed conflict; Article 22 (2), African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child; Article 8 (2) (b) (xxvi) & 8 (2) (e) (vii), Rome Statute; Article 3, ILO 138 Minimum Age Convention; Article 3 (a), ILO 182 Worst Forms of Child Labour Convention; Article 77 (2), Additional Protocol I Geneva Convention; Article 4 (3) (c), Additional Protocol II Geneva Convention

Tags: Armed Conflict (Including Child Soldiers), Access to Education, Process Indicators

Are there special programmes available to reintegrate demobilised child soldiers in the education system?

Definition:

Comments: Without such programmes, demobilised child soldiers may not be able to fully enjoy the right to education

Levels of disaggregation:

Available data:

Human rights standards: Articles 6 (3) & 7, Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Rights of the Child on the involvement of children in armed conflict; Article 39, Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 22 (3), African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child; Article 7 (2) (b) (c), ILO 182 Worst Forms of Child Labour Convention

Tags: Armed Conflict (Including Child Soldiers), Access to Education, Process Indicators

Is children's education ensured by the occupying power?

Definition:

Comments: During military occupation, the occupying power has the duty to make arrangements for the maintenance of the education system if local institutions are unable to do so

Levels of disaggregation:

Available data:

Human rights standards: Articles 24, 50 & 94, Geneva Convention IV relative to the Protection of Civilian Persons in Time of War. Also, importantly, human rights law applies

Tags: Armed Conflict (Including Child Soldiers), Access to Education, Process Indicators

Are children prisoners-of-war given the means to pursue their educational activities?

Definition: Means to pursue their educational activities would include access to regular classes with qualified teachers, access to books, etc.

Comments:

Levels of disaggregation:

Available data:

Human rights standards: Article 40, Standard Minimum Rules for the Treatment of Prisoners; Articles 38, 72 & 125, Geneva Convention III relative to the Treatment of Prisoners of War

Tags: Armed Conflict (Including Child Soldiers), Access to Education, Persons in Detention, Process Indicators

Does the State have a plan on how to comply with minimum educational standards during natural disasters?

Definition:

Comments: Having such a plan before an emergency occurs is crucial to ensuring that children can enjoy the minimum levels of enjoyment of the right to education during or in the wake of natural disasters. For minimum educational standards during emergency situations, see: *The Inter-Agency Network for Education in Emergencies* (INEE): http://www.unicef.org/violencestudy/pdf/min_standards_education_emergencies.pdf

Levels of disaggregation:

Available data:

Human rights standards:

Tags: Natural Disasters, Structural Indicators

If a natural disaster occurred in the last 5 years, did the State respond adequately to ensure minimum educational standards?

Definition:

Comments: For minimum educational standards during emergency situations, *The Inter-Agency Network for Education in Emergencies* (INEE): http://www.unicef.org/violencestudy/pdf/min_standards_education_emergencies.pdf

Levels of disaggregation:

Available data:

Human rights standards:

Tags: Natural Disasters, Process Indicators

Education expenditure ratio

Definition: General government expenditure on education (current, capital, and transfers) is expressed as a percentage of GDP. It includes expenditure funded by transfers from international sources to government. General government usually refers to local, regional and central governments (Source: *UIS*: <http://data.uis.unesco.org/index.aspx?queryname=181>)

Comments: This is the most basic expenditure ratio related to the right to education. It provides a snapshot of the extent of State commitment to the provision of education, reflecting the level of resources the State is willing to invest in education relative to its level of development

Levels of disaggregation:

Available data: *UIS* (Education>Financial resources>Expenditure on education as a percentage of GDP (%)): <http://www.uis.unesco.org/DataCentre/Pages/BrowseEducation.aspx>

Human rights standards: Articles 13 (2) & 14, International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Article 28 (1), Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 24 (2), Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities; Article 7 (2) (c), ILO Convention 182; Article 17 (2), (Revised) European Social Charter; Article 13 (3), Protocol of San Salvador; Article 11 (3), African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child, Article 13 (4), African Youth Charter; Article 41 (2), Arab Charter; Article 4, UNESCO Convention against Discrimination in Education

Tags: Education Financing, Process Indicators

Current public expenditure per pupil as a percentage of GDP per capita

Definition: Current public expenditure per pupil at each level of education, expressed as a percentage of GDP per capita

Comments: This indicator measures the share of per capita income spent on each student. It helps in assessing whether a country's level of investment in education is adequate to the right to education for all. When calculated by level of education, it also indicates the relative costs and emphasis placed by the country on a particular level of education

Levels of disaggregation: Level of Education, Region, Urban/Rural

Available data:

Human rights standards: Article 13 (2) & 14, International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Article 28 (1), Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 24 (2), Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities; Article 7 (2) (c), ILO Convention 182; Article 17 (2), (Revised) European Social Charter; Article 13 (3), Protocol of San Salvador; Article 11 (3), African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child, Article 13 (4), African Youth Charter; Article 41 (2), Arab Charter; Article 4, UNESCO Convention against Discrimination in Education

Tags: Education Financing, Process Indicators

Public expenditure ratio

Definition: This ratio is the percentage of Gross National Product (a proxy to measure national income) that goes into public expenditure

Comments: Public expenditure ratio reflects the size of a government's budget in relation to the size of its economy. It represents the resources a government has at its disposal to undertake all its functions, including in the education field. If this ratio is too low, the State is weakened, making it difficult to adequately provide resources for many competing and often essential functions. If this ratio is too high and a large proportion of national income is drawn into the public sector, this might depress private investment and restrict economic growth, which could jeopardise the sustainability of the realisation of the right to education and other rights

Levels of disaggregation:

Available data: *World Development Indicators:*

<http://data.worldbank.org/indicator/GC.XPN.TOTL.GD.ZS>

Human rights standards: Articles 13 (2) & 14, International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Article 28 (1), Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 24 (2), Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities; Article 7 (2) (c), ILO Convention 182; Article 17 (2), (Revised) European Social Charter; Article 13 (3), Protocol of San Salvador; Article 11 (3), African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child, Article 13 (4), African Youth Charter; Article 41 (2,) Arab Charter; Article 4, UNESCO Convention against Discrimination in Education

Tags: Education Financing, Process Indicators

Education allocation ratio

Definition: The education allocation ratio refers to the percentage of of public expenditure allocated to education

Comments: This indicator reflects the relative priority given to education among competing budgetary needs. This ratio can help expose and challenge cases in which a government might make spurious arguments about lack of sufficient resources to discharge its duty of progressive achievement when, in fact, the problem is not resource constraints but rather

the preference of that government to use available resources for extravagant spending, squandering State resources on unnecessary areas

Levels of disaggregation:

Available data: EdStats: <http://databank.worldbank.org/data/reports.aspx?source=education-statistics>

Human rights standards: Articles 13 (2) & 14, International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Article 28 (1), Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 24 (2), Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities; Article 7 (2) (c), ILO Convention 182; Article 17 (2), (Revised) European Social Charter; Article 13 (3), Protocol of San Salvador; Article 11 (3), African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child, Article 13 (4), African Youth Charter; Article 41 (2), Arab Charter; Article 4, UNESCO Convention against Discrimination in Education

Tags: Education Financing, Process Indicators

Primary education priority ratio

Definition: The primary education priority ratio is the percentage of total education expenditure allocated to primary education

Comments: This indicator reflects priorities within a given educational system. The interpretation of low levels of this ratio will depend on the circumstances. Countries that have already achieved high standards of pre-primary and primary education may be justified in prioritising higher education levels. However, in countries where a significant proportion of the population is illiterate or many children are deprived of the most basic forms of education, a low primary education priority ratio could be interpreted as a violation of a State's immediate obligation to guarantee free and compulsory basic education

Levels of disaggregation:

Available data:

Human rights standards: Articles 13 (2) (a) & 14, International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Article 28 (1) (a) (e), Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 24 (2), Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities; Article 7 (2) (c), ILO Convention 182; Article 17 (2), (Revised) European Social Charter; Article 13 (3) (a) (d), Protocol of San Salvador; Article 11 (3) (a) (d), African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child, Article 13 (4) (a) (c), African Youth Charter; Article 41 (2), Arab Charter; Article 4 (a), UNESCO Convention against Discrimination in Education

Tags: Free Education, Primary, Education Financing, Process Indicators

Does an independent body (eg parliamentary committee) monitor the budget?

Definition:

Comments: Without such a monitoring body it may not be possible to regularly monitor whether the government's budget and allocation of resources are in accordance with human rights standards

Levels of disaggregation:

Available data:

Human rights standards: Articles 13 (2) & 14, International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Article 28 (1), Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 24 (2), Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities; Article 7 (2) (c), ILO Convention 182; Article 17 (2), (Revised) European Social Charter; Article 13 (3), Protocol of San Salvador; Article 11 (3), African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child, Article 13 (4), African Youth Charter; Article 41 (2), Arab Charter; Article 4, UNESCO Convention against Discrimination in Education

Tags: Education Financing, Accountability, Structural Indicators

Is there public access to key public financial documents related to education?

Definition: Key public financial documents include national and regional budgets, periodic reports on execution of the budgets, reports on distribution of resources by province or department

Comments: Public access to key public financial documents related to education provides greater transparency and opportunity to monitor and hold government to account with regard to its education expenditure. The budgetary information publicly available should be sufficiently clear and comprehensive to allow members of civil society to effectively monitor service delivery resource flows and the allocation of funds in the education sectors

Levels of disaggregation:

Available data:

Human rights standards: Article 19 (2) (3), International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights; Article 10, European Convention on Human Rights; Article 13, American Convention on Human Rights; Article 9 (1), African Charter; Article 32 (1), Arab Charter; Article 23, ASEAN Human Rights Declaration

Tags: Education Financing, Accountability, Transparency, Process Indicators

Percentage of State activities in education funded through extrabudgetary sources

Definition: This indicator measures the estimated proportion of State activities in education funded through extrabudgetary sources, as a share of total public spending in education

Comments: Where the use of extrabudgetary funds play a large role in resource allocation, the ability to track government's priorities and to hold the government accountable for the financing of education, may be compromised

Levels of disaggregation:

Available data:

Human rights standards: Articles 13 (2) & 14 International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Article 28 (1), Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 24 (2), Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities; Article 7 (2) (c), ILO Convention 182; Article 17 (2), (Revised) European Social Charter; Article 13 (3), Protocol of San Salvador; Article 11 (3), African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child, Article 13 (4), African Youth Charter; Article 41 (2), Arab Charter; Article 4, UNESCO Convention against Discrimination in Education

Tags: Education Financing, Accountability, Transparency, Process Indicators

Education budget execution rate

Definition: The education budget execution rate is the percentage of the approved budget for the education in the last fiscal year that was actually executed

Comments: If there is no reasonable explanation (eg an unexpected economic crisis that may have forced the government to significantly cut the overall budget or a significant emergency in another sector, such as health or security, which may have forced the government to divert funds originally allocated to education to that sector), significant underspending of the education budget (of over 10%) may be indicative of a violation of the obligation to dedicate maximum available resources to the realisation of the right to education

Levels of disaggregation:

Available data:

Human rights standards: Articles 13 (2) & 14, International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Article 28 (1), Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 24 (2), Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities; Article 7 (2) (c), ILO Convention 182; Article 17 (2), (Revised) European Social Charter; Article 13 (3), Protocol of San Salvador; Article 11 (3), African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child, Article 13 (4), African Youth Charter; Article 41 (2), Arab Charter; Article 4, UNESCO Convention against Discrimination in Education

Tags: Education Financing, Accountability, Process Indicators

Does the State take steps to seek international assistance and cooperation for the realisation of the right to education?

Definition:

Comments: When States do not have enough resources for the realisation of the right to education for all people under its jurisdiction, they are compelled by international human rights law to seek international assistance and cooperation for the full realisation of this right

Levels of disaggregation:

Available data:

Human rights standards: Article 2 (1), International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Articles 4 & 28 (3), Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 8, ILO Convention 182

Tags: Education Financing, Process Indicators

Are there effective mechanisms to ensure that civil society organisations are consulted when multilateral or bilateral agreements that have an effect on the right to education are negotiated?

Definition:

Comments: Multilateral or bilateral agreements often have an effect on the right to education and therefore civil society organisations should be consulted when such agreements are being negotiated. Civil society organisations have specialist knowledge and can give comments on the potential effects of such agreements

Levels of disaggregation:

Available data:

Human rights standards: Article 25 (a), International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights; Article 2 (1), International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Articles 4 & 28 (3), Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 8, ILO Convention 182

Tags: Education Financing, Participation, Process Indicators

Do domestic laws protect the right to establish private schools?

Definition:

Comments: According to human rights standards, the State should not interfere with the liberty of individuals and bodies to establish and direct educational institutions, subject to the requirement that the education given in such institutions shall conform with minimum standards set by the State

Levels of disaggregation:**Available data:**

Human rights standards: Article 13 (4), International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Article 29 (2), Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 13 (5), Protocol of San Salvador; Article 11 (7), African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child; Article 14 (3), European Union Charter of Fundamental Rights; Article 2, Optional Protocol 1 European Convention on Human Rights; Article 17 (1) (a), (Revised) European Social Charter; Article 13, Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities; Article 27 (3), ILO Convention 169

Tags: Educational Freedom/Private Education, Structural Indicators

Is there a private school accreditation system?**Definition:**

Comments: Such accreditation systems may be necessary to ensure that minimum educational standards set by the State are met in all private schools (and not only in public schools)

Levels of disaggregation:**Available data:**

Human rights standards: Article 13 (4), International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Article 29 (2), Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 13 (5), Protocol of San Salvador; Article 11 (7), African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child; Article 14 (3), European Union Charter of Fundamental Rights; Article 2, Optional Protocol 1, European Convention on Human Rights; Article 17 (1) (a), (Revised) European Social Charter; Article 13, Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities; Article 27 (3), ILO Convention 169

Tags: Quality of Education, Educational Freedom/Private Education, Process Indicators

Do domestic laws expressly recognise the liberty of parents to choose the religious and moral education of their children in conformity with their own convictions?

Definition: (Source: Audrey Chapman (2007) *Development of Indicators for Economic, Social and Cultural Rights: The Rights to Education, Participation in Cultural Life and Access to the Benefits of Science*: p.141)

Comments: According to human rights standards, States have to respect the liberty of parents to ensure the religious and moral education of their children in conformity with their own convictions. This includes, *inter alia*, allowing children to be exempted from attending schools on important holy days for their respective religions, taking into account dietary

requirements relating to religion and allowing children to be exempted from religious or moral classes not in accordance with their religious or moral convictions

Levels of disaggregation:

Available data:

Human rights standards: Article 18 (4), International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights; Article 13 (3), International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Article 14 (2), Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 12 (4), Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families; Article 14 (3), European Union Charter of Fundamental Rights; Article 5 (b), UNESCO Convention against Discrimination in Education; Article 2, Optional Protocol 1, European Convention on Human Rights; Article 17 (1) (a), (Revised) European Social Charter; Article 13 (4), Protocol of San Salvador; Article 12 (4), Pact of San Jose; Article 50, Geneva Convention 4; Article 78 (2), AP1 Geneva Convention; Article 4 (3) (a), AP2 Geneva Convention

Tags: Educational Freedom/Private Education, Structural Indicators

Number of reported incidents in which a school has not provided for specific accommodation of children's religious or moral convictions

Definition: This indicator measures the number of reported incidents in the last 12 months

Comments: Specific accommodation for children's religious or moral convictions includes, inter alia, allowing children to be exempted from attending schools on important holy days for their respective religions, taking into account dietary requirements relating to religion and allowing children to be exempted from religious or moral classes not in accordance with their religious or moral convictions

Levels of disaggregation:

Available data:

Human rights standards: Article 26, International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights; Article 30, Convention on the Rights of the Child

Tags: Educational Freedom/Private Education, Process Indicators

Is there a monitoring body overseeing whether schools respect religious freedom?

Definition:

Comments: Without such monitoring bodies it may not be possible to regularly monitor whether schools actually respect religious freedom

Levels of disaggregation:

Available data:

Human rights standards: Article 18 (4), International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights; Article 13 (3), International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Article 14 (2), Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 12 (4), Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families; Article 14 (3), European Union Charter of Fundamental Rights; Article 5 (b), UNESCO Convention against Discrimination in Education; Article 2, Optional Protocol 1, European Convention on Human Rights; Article 13 (4), Protocol of San Salvador; Article 12 (4), Pact of San Jose; Article 78 (2), AP1 Geneva Convention; Article 4 (3) (a), AP2 Geneva Convention

Tags: Educational Freedom/Private Education, Accountability, Process Indicators

Is there a school inspection system?

Definition:

Comments: A school inspection system is needed to assess the quality of education provided in each school and ensure that it complies with standards established in legislation and policy

Levels of disaggregation: Public/Private

Available data:

Human rights standards: Article 13, International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Article 28, Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 17 (2), (Revised) European Social Charter; Article 13, Protocol of San Salvador; Article 11, African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child; Article 13, African Youth Charter; Article 41 (2), Arab Charter; Article 4, UNESCO Convention against Discrimination in Education

Tags: Quality of Education, Accountability, Process Indicators

Frequency of inspection visits

Definition: Frequency of inspection visits is the average number of visits made by an inspector in each school in the last 12 months

Comments:

Levels of disaggregation: Region, Urban/Rural, Public/Private

Available data:

Human rights standards: Article 13, International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Article 28, Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 17 (2), (Revised) European Social Charter; Article 13, Protocol of San Salvador; Article 11, African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child; Article 13, African Youth Charter; Article 41 (2), Arab Charter; Article 4, UNESCO Convention against Discrimination in Education

Tags: Quality of Education, Accountability, Process Indicators

Is there a State body responsible for monitoring the education system?

Definition: The State body could be, for instance, a monitoring department of the Ministry of Education or some State institution whose mandate is to monitor the activities of the executive (eg ombudsman, Human Rights Commission, etc.)

Comments: A State body responsible for monitoring the education system typically monitors progress on issues of access to education, quality of education and equality. Often they also monitor the extent to which specific goals set by the government have been achieved

Levels of disaggregation:

Available data:

Human rights standards: Article 13, International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Article 28, Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 17 (2), (Revised) European Social Charter; Article 13, Protocol of San Salvador; Article 11, African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child; Article 13, African Youth Charter; Article 41 (2), Arab Charter; Article 4, UNESCO Convention against Discrimination in Education

Tags: Quality of Education, Accountability, Process Indicators

Does the State regularly gather data on education?

Definition:

Comments: Data on education needs to be gathered regularly in order to monitor the right to education and assess the progressive realisation of the right to education. Check if the data is disaggregated by primary / secondary / tertiary education level, gender, region, rural / urban, minority, income and disability type. Are disaggregated data disaggregated again by other relevant categories in order to address multiple discrimination?

Levels of disaggregation:

Available data:

Human rights standards: Article 13, International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Article 28, Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 17 (2), (Revised) European Social Charter; Article 13, Protocol of San Salvador; Article 11, African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child; Article 13, African Youth Charter; Article 41 (2), Arab Charter; Article 4, UNESCO Convention against Discrimination in Education

Tags: Quality of Education, Access to Education, Accountability, Process Indicators

Do civil society organisations face obstacles set by the State when monitoring the right to education?

Definition: Common obstacles include, inter alia, not allowing civil society organisations to operate freely in the State, withholding information from civil society organisations that is

necessary for monitoring the right to education and hindering access of these organisations to schools for monitoring purposes

Comments: Civil society organisations can play an important ‘watchdog’ role to monitor and evaluate education policies and programmes, and to hold politicians and school officials to account for the delivery of good quality education in an equitable manner

Levels of disaggregation:

Available data:

Human rights standards: Article 25 (a), International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights

Tags: Participation, Accountability, Transparency, Process Indicators

Is the education data gathered by the State publicly available?

Definition:

Comments: Public access to data on education is essential for enabling civil society to participate in monitoring the right to education and holding the government accountable for the realisation of this right

Levels of disaggregation:

Available data:

Human rights standards: Article 19 (2) (3), International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights; Article 10, European Convention on Human Rights; Article 13, American Convention on Human Rights; Article 32 (1), Arab Charter; Article 23, ASEAN; Article 13, International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Article 28, Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 17 (2), (Revised) European Social Charter; Article 13, Protocol of San Salvador; Article 11, African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child; Article 13, African Youth Charter; Article 41 (2), Arab Charter; Article 4, UNESCO Convention against Discrimination in Education

Tags: Transparency, Accountability, Structural Indicators

Does the State body responsible for monitoring the education system produce regular and publicly available reports on the state of education?

Definition:

Comments: Public access to these reports is essential for enabling civil society to participate in monitoring the right to education and holding the government accountable for the realisation of this right

Levels of disaggregation:

Available data:

Human rights standards: Article 19 (2) (3), International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights; Article 10, European Convention on Human Rights; Article 13, American Convention on Human Rights; Article 32 (1), Arab Charter; Article 23, ASEAN Human Rights Declaration; Article 13, International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Article 28, Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 17 (2), (Revised) European Social Charter; Article 13, Protocol of San Salvador; Article 11, African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child; Article 13, African Youth Charter; Article 41 (2), Arab Charter; Article 4, UNESCO Convention against Discrimination in Education

Tags: Accountability, Transparency, Process Indicators

Are the criteria used to select the schools or children that benefit from targeted programmes publicly available?

Definition: Targeted programmes in the education sector are those that are not universal (ie that the beneficiaries are only a segment of the population) either because by its very nature a programme is meant to help a specific group (eg cash transfers to poor families to help them meet the various types of costs associated with education) or because the State does not have enough resources to provide at this stage to everybody in the education system

Comments: Transparency about the criteria for targeted programmes is necessary to ensure that the implementation of those programmes is not discriminatory and to enable civil society to hold the government accountable for them

Levels of disaggregation:

Available data:

Human rights standards:

Tags: Accountability, Transparency, Process Indicators

Does the State have effective administrative complaint mechanism(s) to file complaints on violations of the right to education?

Definition: Complaint mechanisms may be set up within the Education Ministry and / or within non-judicial oversight institutions such as a human rights commission, the supreme audit institution, or an anti-corruption agency

Comments: To assess whether the complaint mechanisms are effective, check, inter alia, the extent to which parents and children are aware of specific complaint procedures and the extent to which schools publicise the existence of such procedures (eg placing a complaint box in a each school, setting up a complaint mechanism on the website of the Ministry of Education, etc.); whether complaints can be filed in a language other than the majority language; whether there are effective guarantees against reprisal to protect any person making a complaint and the extent to which official inquiries or other follow-up actions are

taken after someone files a complaint, and whether those steps are carried out in a timely manner

Levels of disaggregation:

Available data:

Human rights standards: Article 13, International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Article 28, Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 17 (2), (Revised) European Social Charter; Article 13, Protocol of San Salvador; Article 11, African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child; Article 13, African Youth Charter; Article 41 (2), Arab Charter; Article 4, UNESCO Convention against Discrimination in Education.

Provisions on effective remedies: Article 2 (3), International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights; Article 2, Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women; Article 6, International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination; Article 7, African Charter; Article 25, American Convention on Human Rights; Article 13, European Convention on Human Rights

Tags: Accountability, Process Indicators

Number of administrative complaints on the right to education

Definition: This indicator is the number of complaints regarding issues related to the right to education in the last 12 months. Issues include, *inter alia* availability or accessibility of primary education, funding of primary education, availability or accessibility of secondary education, accessibility of higher education, discrimination issues, registration or closing of private schools and parents' rights to ensure the religious and moral education of their children in conformity with their own convictions (Source: Audrey Chapman (2007) *Development of Indicators for Economic, Social and Cultural Rights: The Rights to Education, Participation in Cultural Life and Access to the Benefits of Science*: p.149)

Comments: A very low number of administrative complaints on education rights may be indicative of the lack of adequate access to administrative complaint mechanisms rather than a lack of problems related to the right to education. Conversely, a very high number of administrative complaints may be indicative of adequate access to administrative complaint mechanisms, but at the same time of serious problem in the education system itself. If the focus of the monitoring exercise is a specific marginalised group, check the number of complaints related to that group

Levels of disaggregation: Gender, Region, Urban/Rural, Public/Private, Minority, Persons with Disabilities, Persons with HIV/AIDS, Migrants, Refugees and IDPs, Persons in Detention

Available data:

Human rights standards: Article 13, International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Article 28, Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 17 (2), (Revised) European Social Charter; Article 13, Protocol of San Salvador; Article 11, African Charter on the Rights

and Welfare of the Child; Article 13, African Youth Charter; Article 41 (2), Arab Charter; Article 4, UNESCO Convention against Discrimination in Education.

Provisions on effective remedies: Article 2 (3), International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights; Article 2, Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women; Article 6, International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination; Article 7, African Charter; Article 25, American Convention on Human Rights; Article 13, European Convention on Human Rights

Tags: Women and Girls, Indigenous Peoples and Minorities, Persons with Disabilities, Persons with HIV/AIDS, Migrants, Refugees and IDPs, Persons in Detention, Persons Living in Poverty, Accountability, Process Indicators

Proportion of received complaints on the right to education that have been investigated by an administrative body

Definition: This indicator measures the proportion of complaints that have been investigated by an administrative body in the last 12 months

Comments: A low value of this indicator would be indicative of an inadequate mechanism to investigate complaints on the right to education. If the focus of the monitoring exercise is a specific marginalised group, check the number of complaints related to that group

Levels of disaggregation: Gender, Region, Urban/Rural, Public/Private, Minority, Persons with Disabilities, Persons with HIV/AIDS, Migrants, Refugees and IDPs, Persons in Detention

Available data:

Human rights standards: Article 13, International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Article 28, Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 17 (2), (Revised) European Social Charter; Article 13, Protocol of San Salvador; Article 11, African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child; Article 13, African Youth Charter; Article 41 (2), Arab Charter; Article 4, UNESCO Convention against Discrimination in Education.

Provisions on effective remedies: Article 2 (3), International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights; Article 2, Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women; Article 6, International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination; Article 7, African Charter; Article 25, American Convention on Human Rights; Article 13, European Convention on Human Rights

Tags: Women and Girls, Indigenous Peoples and Minorities, Persons with Disabilities, Persons with HIV/AIDS, Migrants, Refugees and IDPs, Persons in Detention, Persons Living in Poverty, Accountability, Process Indicators

Number of court cases on the right to education

Definition: Number of court cases on educational rights is the number of cases that considered issues related to the right to education in the last five years. The issues to

examine include, inter alia availability or accessibility of primary education, funding of primary education, availability or accessibility of secondary education, accessibility of higher education, discrimination issues, registration or closing of private schools and parents' rights to ensure the religious and moral education of their children in conformity with their own convictions (Source: Audrey Chapman (2007) *Development of Indicators for Economic, Social and Cultural Rights: The Rights to Education, Participation in Cultural Life and Access to the Benefits of Science*: p.149)

Comments: A very low number of court cases on education rights may be indicative of the lack of adequate access to the justice system rather than a lack of problems related to the right to education. Conversely, a very high number of court cases may be indicative of adequate access to the judicial system, but at the same time of serious problems in the education system itself. If the focus of the monitoring exercise is a specific marginalised group, check the number of court cases related to that group

Levels of disaggregation: Gender, Region, Urban/Rural, Public/Private, Minority, Persons with Disabilities, Persons with HIV/AIDS, Migrants, Refugees and IDPs, Persons in Detention

Available data:

Human rights standards: Article 13, International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Article 28, Convention on the Rights of the Child; Article 17 (2), (Revised) European Social Charter; Article 13, Protocol of San Salvador; Article 11, African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child; Article 13, African Youth Charter; Article 41 (2), Arab Charter; Article 4, UNESCO Convention against Discrimination in Education.

Provisions on effective remedies: Article 2 (3), International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights; Article 2, Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women; Article 6, International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination; Article 7, African Charter; Article 25, American Convention on Human Rights; Article 13, European Convention on Human Rights

Tags: Women and Girls, Indigenous Peoples and Minorities, Persons with Disabilities, Persons with HIV/AIDS, Migrants, Refugees and IDPs, Persons in Detention, Persons Living in Poverty, Accountability, Process Indicators

Proportion of court cases where it has been determined that there has been a violation of the right to education

Definition: This indicator measures the proportion of court cases related to the right to education that have been adjudicated against the State in the last 5 years

Comments: A very low value of this indicator may be indicative of a lack of judicial independence vis-à-vis the government

Levels of disaggregation: Gender, Region, Urban/Rural, Public/Private, Minority, Persons with Disabilities, Persons with HIV/AIDS, Migrants, Refugees and IDPs, Persons in Detention

Available data:

Human rights standards:

Tags: Women and Girls, Indigenous Peoples and Minorities, Persons with Disabilities, Persons with HIV/AIDS, Migrants, Refugees and IDPS, Persons in Detention, Persons Living in Poverty, Accountability, Process Indicators

If the educational system is decentralised, are the responsibilities of each level of government for education clearly defined and available to the public?

Definition:

Comments: This indicator is necessary to assess whether there is duplication and / or lack of clarity in division of roles between different levels of government which can often weaken accountability for the delivery of educational services

Levels of disaggregation:

Available data:

Human rights standards: Article 25 (c), International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights; Articles 13 (1) & (2), African Charter of Human and People's Rights; Article 23 (c), American Convention on Human Rights

Tags: Transparency, Decentralisation, Structural Indicators

If the educational system is decentralised, is the distribution of funds for education from national to local level commensurate with the responsibilities devolved to the local level?

Definition: For instance, if the national government devolves the responsibility for hiring and paying teachers to the local level but doesn't provide to the local level the funds that until then were allocated for that purpose, the poorer local jurisdictions may not be able to hire all the necessary teachers

Comments: If the distribution of funds for education from national to local level is not commensurate with the devolution of responsibilities to local levels of government – as it is often the case in decentralised educational systems – local governments may not be able to adequately undertake all the responsibilities that are necessary to ensure the full enjoyment of the right to education of people living under its jurisdiction.

Levels of disaggregation:

Available data:

Human rights standards: Article 25 (c), International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights; Article 13 (1) & (2), African Charter of Human and People's Rights; Article 23 (c), American Convention on Human Rights

Tags: Transparency, Decentralisation, Structural Indicators

If financing of some aspects of the educational system depends on revenues collected by local authorities, is there an effective system to ensure that local authorities that cannot afford it are able to provide basic education services?

Definition:

Comments: If there is no such system and the budget for essential aspects of the educational systems only depends on the capacity of each local government to mobilise local resources, those living in the poorer areas may not be able to fully enjoy the right to education

Levels of disaggregation:

Available data:

Human rights standards: Article 25 (c), International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights; Article 13 (1) & (2), African Charter of Human and People's Rights; Article 23 (c), American Convention on Human Rights

Tags: Decentralisation, Education Financing, Process Indicators

If the educational system is decentralised, does the national government provide capacity-building for local administrators, policymakers and education workers?

Definition:

Comments: Without concrete efforts by the national government to provide capacity-building to weak local authorities, these may lack adequate technical and managerial capacity to ensure, *inter alia*, proper teacher training, effective monitoring and oversight mechanisms and an appropriate financing system for education

Levels of disaggregation:

Available data:

Human rights standards: Article 25 (c), International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights; Articles 13 (1) & (2), African Charter of Human and People's Rights; Article 23 (c), American Convention on Human Rights

Tags: Decentralisation, Participation, Process Indicators